



EVALUATING AN ARABIC MORPHOLOGY MEMORIZATION PROGRAM: A CIPP MODEL STUDY AT MA'HAD HASAN BIN ALI SAMARINDA

Andi Bangsawan Tolare ¹, Misykat Malik Ibrahim ², Rappe ³

^{1,2,3} Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar, Indonesia

Abstract

Improving students' comprehension of Arabic requires well-designed and effective learning programs. However, its implementation still faces several challenges, including low student interest and motivation, as well as suboptimal achievement of learning objectives. This study aims to evaluate the Wazan Sharaf memorization program (i.e., patterns of Arabic word formation) at Ma'had Hasan bin Ali Samarinda based on the four aspects of the CIPP model (Context, Input, Process, Product). The research employed a Mixed-Method Research (MMR) approach with first- and second-semester students as subjects ($n = 23$). Data were collected through interviews, observations, and tests, all of which were validated by an external expert. Quantitative data were analyzed descriptively, while qualitative data were analyzed using the interactive model of Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña, with both data types integrated through triangulation. The findings indicate that, in the context aspect, the program aligns with the vision and mission of the Ma'had. In the input aspect, learning facilities are adequate, supported by relevant instructional materials, and competent instructors despite not having formal degrees in Arabic Language Education. In the process aspect, learning is implemented systematically, although constrained by low memorization interest and limited instructional time. In the product aspect, students demonstrate satisfactory learning achievement, with an average score of 81.67 ($SD = 11.5$) in the first semester and 80.00 ($SD = 14.4$) in the second semester, indicating moderate to good mastery levels despite variation among students. The study concludes that the program contributes positively to students' understanding of Wazan Sharaf. Recommendations include formalizing the program through official documentation, increasing instructional time, integrating technology-based learning media, and strengthening students' mastery of the material.

Keywords: Program Evaluation, CIPP Model, *Wazan Sharaf*, Arabic Language

* Correspondence Address:	bangsawanlandi@gmail.com			
Article History	Received	Revised	Accepted	Published
	2025-08-13	2026-03-10	2026-04-08	2025-06-15

INTRODUCTION

مقدمة

Arabic is an international language spoken by more than 280 million people worldwide and serves as the official language in 25 countries. Its uniqueness lies in its status as the language of the Qur'an, Hadith, and Islamic sciences, making it the primary key to understanding Islamic teachings deeply and accurately (Pane, 2018). In Indonesia, where the majority of the population is Muslim, Arabic holds a significant role in education, particularly in Islamic educational institutions such as madrasahs, pesantrens, and ma'hads. Arabic instruction is provided from the elementary level, such as Madrasah Ibtidaiyah, up to higher education, and even in specialized institutions like Arabic language study centers and ma'hads. Within this broader educational context, the effectiveness of Arabic learning programs at the institutional level becomes a critical

concern, particularly in ensuring that foundational linguistic competencies are successfully achieved.

In learning Arabic, mastery of *nahwu* and *sharaf* is a fundamental foundation that every learner must acquire. *Nahwu* functions to determine the *i'rab* or final vowel markings of words in sentences, while *sharaf* studies morphological changes (*tashrif*) and word patterns (*wazan*). Mastery of *wazan sharaf* is crucial as it enables learners to recognize root words, form new vocabulary, and comprehend the meaning of words within their proper context (Fadli & Muzayin, 2023). Recent studies in Arabic morphology pedagogy also emphasize that pattern-based learning and repeated exposure significantly improve learners' linguistic processing and vocabulary acquisition (Al-Jarf, 2021; Alqahtani, 2022).

Ma'had Hasan bin Ali Samarinda implements the *wazan sharaf* memorization program as a learning strategy to strengthen students' ability to master patterns of word changes in a systematic manner. Through memorizing *wazan*, students are expected to understand grammatical rules, expand their vocabulary, and enhance their skills in reading, writing, and translating classical Arabic texts. However, after the program had been running for three years, preliminary evaluations indicated several challenges, such as limited instructional time that did not align with memorization targets, differences in students' basic Arabic proficiency levels, and low interest and motivation among some participants. These conditions pose a risk that the program's objectives may not be optimally achieved without a comprehensive evaluation.

Program evaluation is therefore necessary to identify the alignment of objectives, the effectiveness of implementation, and the attainment of learning outcomes, as well as to provide recommendations for improvement. The evaluation model employed in this study is the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model developed by Stufflebeam (2007), which has been widely applied across various educational contexts due to its comprehensive and decision-oriented nature. Previous studies have demonstrated the effectiveness of the CIPP model in evaluating diverse educational programs, including inclusive education curricula (Agus et al., 2023), tahfidz programs in Islamic boarding schools (Ayyusufi et al., 2022), online learning in higher education (Damayanti et al., 2022), curriculum evaluation in madrasahs (Musolin et al., 2023), and course evaluation in higher education settings (Rejina & Baral, 2023). Furthermore, the model has also been applied in broader interdisciplinary contexts such as medical education (Babadi et al., 2024; Chanthalangsy et al., 2024), entrepreneurship education (Fan et al., 2022), and teaching quality evaluation systems (Li & Hu, 2022), indicating its flexibility and robustness across disciplines. A critical review by Ratnay et al. (2022) further confirms that the CIPP model remains one of the most comprehensive frameworks for evaluating vocational and educational programs.

Operationally, the CIPP model in this study is used to examine the alignment between the program's background, vision, mission, and objectives (context), the readiness of resources including instructors, materials, and facilities (input), the effectiveness of instructional implementation and learning interactions (process), and the level of student achievement in mastering and applying *wazan sharaf* patterns (product). Several previous studies also reinforce the urgency of applying the CIPP model in educational evaluation. Mukarromah (2022) found that the model provides a comprehensive overview for program improvement in character education, Fitriani (2021) reported alignment between planning and implementation in an Arabic e-learning program, Kheryadi (2022) demonstrated improved language skills in a public speaking program, and Kurniawati (2021) emphasized that although comprehensive, the model requires substantial resources and time.

Despite these studies, limited research has specifically examined the evaluation of Arabic morphology (*sharaf*) learning programs, particularly in the context of Islamic boarding institutions (*ma'had*). This indicates a clear research gap, especially considering the importance of *sharaf* in developing students' linguistic competence. Therefore, this study seeks to fill this gap by evaluating the *wazan sharaf* memorization program at Ma'had Hasan bin Ali Samarinda using the CIPP model. Based on the theoretical framework and findings from previous studies, this research focuses on evaluating the alignment of the program's objectives and background, the readiness of supporting resources, the effectiveness of program implementation, and the level of students' achievement in memorizing and understanding *wazan sharaf*.

METHOD

منهج

This study employed an evaluative research design aimed at assessing the effectiveness of the Wazan Sharaf Memorization Program at Ma'had Hasan Bin Ali Samarinda. The evaluation model used was the CIPP model (Context, Input, Process, Product) developed by Stufflebeam (2007), which is considered appropriate for examining program relevance, implementation, and outcomes, as well as generating practical recommendations for improvement.

This research adopted a mixed-method approach using a convergent parallel design, in which qualitative and quantitative data were collected simultaneously, analyzed separately, and then integrated at the interpretation stage to obtain a comprehensive understanding of the program's effectiveness.

The study was conducted at Ma'had Hasan Bin Ali Samarinda during the odd and even semesters of the 2024/2025 academic year. The research subjects consisted of all first- and second-semester students participating in the Wazan Sharaf memorization program ($n = 23$). Given the relatively small sample size, this study does not aim for statistical generalization; rather, its strength lies in providing an in-depth contextual understanding supported by descriptive quantitative data. The object of this study is the effectiveness of the program, examined through the four components of the CIPP evaluation model.

Data were collected through interviews, observations, tests, and documentation. Structured interviews were conducted with the Ma'had leadership, instructors, and students to obtain in-depth information on the program's background, objectives, and implementation. Direct observations were carried out during classroom sessions to evaluate instructional practices, student engagement, and challenges encountered. Documentation techniques were used to review relevant records, such as attendance lists, curriculum documents, and institutional archives.

The quantitative instrument consisted of a written test comprising 10 items with a total score of 100 points, designed based on Bloom's Taxonomy levels (C1–C3), focusing on students' ability to recognize, classify, and apply *wazan sharaf* patterns.

The research instruments included interview guidelines, observation sheets, and test sheets. To ensure content validity, all instruments were validated by an external expert in Arabic language education (Sugiyono, 2019).

Qualitative data were analyzed using the interactive model of Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña (2014), which involves data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing. Quantitative data were analyzed using descriptive statistics, including mean scores, standard

deviation, and percentage distribution of student achievement categories.

The integration of qualitative and quantitative findings was conducted through triangulation at the interpretation stage, allowing the researcher to compare, confirm, and enrich findings from both data sources to produce more robust conclusions.

In terms of research ethics, this study adhered to ethical research standards. All participants were informed about the purpose of the study and provided their consent prior to data collection. Confidentiality and anonymity of participants were maintained, and all data were used solely for research purposes.

With this methodological design, the study is expected to produce a comprehensive evaluation of the Wazan Sharaf memorization program, while also contributing to the development of Arabic language learning strategies in Islamic educational institutions.

RESULT | نتائج

1. Context Stage

The evaluation at the context stage was conducted through interviews, observations, and document analysis. The findings indicate that Ma'had Hasan Bin Ali Samarinda, established in 2010 and currently under the Faculty of Law at Universitas Muhammadiyah Kalimantan Timur, positions Arabic mastery as its core institutional focus.

The wazan sharaf memorization program is designed as a strategic response to this institutional orientation. Interviews with the Ma'had leadership revealed a strong alignment between the program and the institutional vision of producing Arabic-proficient scholars and preachers. As stated by the Director:

“This Ma'had focuses on Arabic, and therefore students must memorize wazan sharaf. Ilmu sharaf cannot be separated from nahwu...”

From a thematic analysis, three key patterns emerged:

- a. Strategic alignment: the program directly supports institutional goals;
- b. Foundational necessity: sharaf is viewed as indispensable for Arabic mastery;
- c. Diverse student readiness: students from non-pesantren backgrounds experience initial difficulty due to cognitive load in memorization.

However, document analysis revealed that the program has not yet been formalized into an official written guideline. This indicates a gap between strategic importance and administrative formalization, which may affect long-term sustainability.

2. Input Stage

The input evaluation focused on instructor competence, facilities, and learning materials. The program is delivered by two instructors with educational backgrounds from Middle Eastern institutions and LIPIA Jakarta, indicating strong content mastery despite the absence of formal degrees in Arabic Language Education.

Facilities were generally considered adequate, including classrooms, whiteboards, and air conditioning. Learning materials consist primarily of *Kitab Silsilah Ilmiyyah* and *Mengenai Ilmu Sharaf Lebih Dekat*, which provide structured and practical guidance for memorization.

Thematic analysis of student responses identified three main findings:

- Adequate physical environment, supporting learning comfort;
- Material accessibility issues, as dense explanations require additional instructor support;
- Need for multimodal learning, particularly audio-based media to reinforce memorization through rhythm and pronunciation.

These findings suggest that while the input component is generally sufficient, optimization is needed in terms of instructional media and material delivery strategies.

3. Process Stage

The learning process is implemented systematically in stages according to semester level. The first semester focuses on *tsulasi mujarrad*, while the second semester progresses to *rubai'* forms. Instruction combines explanation, memorization, and group-based reinforcement.

Observations indicate that the instructional process follows a structured sequence: explanation, guided practice, memorization, and evaluation. Classroom interaction is active and collaborative, with peer-assisted learning playing a significant role.

However, deeper analysis reveals underlying challenges:

- Cognitive load differences: students without prior Arabic background struggle more due to unfamiliarity with morphological patterns;
- Time constraint: limited instructional time (2 hours/week) reduces opportunities for repetition, which is crucial in memorization-based learning;
- Motivational factors: lower interest in memorization is linked to perceived difficulty and lack of variation in learning methods;
- Minimal technology integration: reliance on traditional *talaqqi* limits engagement and flexibility.

Thus, while the process is structurally well-organized, its effectiveness is influenced by pedagogical and psychological factors.

4. Product Stage

The product evaluation focuses on students' learning achievement in understanding and applying *wazan sharaf*. The results indicate that students generally demonstrate the ability to identify and classify Arabic morphological forms, although levels of achievement vary.

Table 1. Students' Learning Achievement in Wazan Sharaf

Semester	Mean	SD	High (%)	Medium (%)	Low (%)
Semester 1	81.67	11.5	17%	50%	33%
Semester 2	80.00	14.4	18%	64%	18%

The data show that the majority of students fall into the medium achievement category in both semesters. Although the mean score slightly decreased in the second semester, the proportion of students in the high category increased.

From a qualitative perspective, three main factors explain the variation in achievement:

- Educational background differences, affecting initial comprehension;
- Conceptual complexity, as *rubai'* patterns require deeper understanding compared to

tsulasi;

- c. Learning motivation, influencing consistency in memorization.

Students reported improved understanding of morphological patterns and increased ability to memorize key wazan. However, full mastery has not yet been achieved, indicating that learning outcomes are moderate and uneven across participants. Overall, the findings suggest that the program has succeeded in facilitating learning achievement in wazan sharaf, although further improvements are needed to ensure more equitable outcomes.

DISCUSSION

مناقشة

1. Context of the *Wazan Sharaf* Memorization Program

The findings indicate that the wazan sharaf memorization program at Ma'had Hasan Bin Ali Samarinda demonstrates strong alignment with the institution's vision and mission, particularly in strengthening Arabic language mastery as a foundation for understanding Islamic texts. This is consistent with Al-Ghalayaini's (2005) view that *nahwu* and *sharaf* are indispensable components of Arabic linguistic competence. From a theoretical perspective, this alignment reflects what Sukmadinata (2011) describes as program relevance, where educational initiatives are closely tied to institutional goals.

Furthermore, the use of structured tabular memorization supports information processing theory, which emphasizes repetition and pattern recognition in strengthening cognitive retention (Slavin, 2018). The relevance of contextual alignment in program evaluation is also supported by recent studies emphasizing that the *context* component in the CIPP model plays a crucial role in ensuring that educational programs address real institutional needs and learner characteristics Fan et al. (2022); Li and Hu (2022). Similarly, evaluations in Islamic education contexts confirm that alignment between program objectives and institutional vision significantly determines program effectiveness Musolin et al. (2023).

When compared with other studies, similar findings are reported in Arabic programs in Indonesian pesantren contexts, where memorization of linguistic patterns remains a dominant strategy for building foundational competence. However, unlike some pesantren-based programs in Java that have integrated structured curricula and formal evaluation systems, the program in this study remains non-formal. This lack of formalization creates a structural gap that may affect program sustainability and institutional accountability, as also highlighted in broader CIPP-based evaluations that stress the importance of institutional support structures Ratnay et al. (2022); Rejina and Baral (2023). Thus, while strategic alignment is strong, institutional formalization remains a critical missing link in ensuring long-term program effectiveness.

2. Input in the *Wazan Sharaf* Memorization Program

The input evaluation demonstrates that the program is supported by competent instructors and adequate facilities. Although the instructors do not hold formal degrees in Arabic Language Education, their academic experiences in Middle Eastern institutions and LIPIA Jakarta contribute significantly to their teaching competence, supporting Halimah's (2019) argument that immersion and academic exposure can compensate for formal disciplinary alignment.

However, when viewed in comparison with contemporary Arabic language programs, particularly those in Middle Eastern institutions, there is a notable difference in the use of

instructional media, as modern Arabic pedagogy increasingly integrates multimodal resources to enhance engagement and retention. Recent studies using the CIPP model also emphasize that the *input* component is not only about resource availability but also about the appropriateness and adaptability of those resources to learners' needs Shaheen and Mahmood (2024); Suharman and Rohman (2022).

The findings of this study reveal that students perceive the existing materials as helpful but cognitively demanding, indicating that while the input component is functionally adequate, it lacks pedagogical adaptation. This aligns with findings from early childhood and higher education contexts, where effective input requires alignment between materials, learner readiness, and instructional strategies Suryana et al. (2023); Zhao et al. (2025). Therefore, the integration of technology-based learning media becomes essential, not only to improve accessibility but also to enhance cognitive engagement. These findings suggest that input quality is determined not merely by the presence of resources but by how effectively they are pedagogically optimized.

3. Process of the *Wazan Sharaf* Memorization Program

The process evaluation shows that the program is implemented systematically through staged instruction and collaborative learning. The use of peer-assisted learning aligns with collaborative learning theory, which emphasizes interaction and mutual support in enhancing understanding (Johnson & Johnson, 2019).

However, a deeper analysis reveals that the effectiveness of the process is influenced by several underlying factors, including differences in students' prior knowledge, limited instructional time, and varying levels of learning motivation. These findings are consistent with recent CIPP-based evaluations, which highlight that the *process* component is highly dependent on instructional design, learner engagement, and contextual constraints Zahroh et al. (2025). When compared to other Arabic learning contexts, such as intensive programs in Middle Eastern universities, instructional processes are typically supported by immersive environments and technology-enhanced systems.

In contrast, the reliance on traditional *talaqqi* methods in this program, while effective for maintaining teacher-student closeness, limits flexibility and learner autonomy. Therefore, integrating technology into the learning process is not merely an innovation but a necessity to improve engagement and learning outcomes. These findings reinforce the argument that process effectiveness is shaped by the interaction between pedagogy, learner characteristics, and instructional support systems.

4. Product of the *Wazan Sharaf* Memorization Program

The findings show that students achieved a moderate level of competence in understanding and applying *wazan sharaf*. Rather than claiming "improvement," the results are more accurately interpreted as learning achievement, as no pre-test baseline was used. Quantitative results indicate that most students fall within the medium achievement category, with some reaching higher levels of mastery, although variability remains significant.

From a qualitative perspective, this variation can be explained by differences in educational background, increasing conceptual complexity of *rubai'* patterns, and varying levels of learning motivation. These findings are consistent with broader educational evaluation studies, which emphasize that learning outcomes are influenced by both instructional design and internal learner factors.

Comparative studies using the CIPP model also indicate that product outcomes often reflect cumulative effects of context, input, and process components, rather than functioning as isolated results Fan et al. (2022); Zhao et al. (2025). When compared with similar Arabic learning programs in pesantren and formal institutions, a consistent pattern emerges in which memorization-based approaches are effective for foundational knowledge but tend to produce uneven outcomes without differentiated instruction. This suggests that achieving equitable learning outcomes requires more adaptive and student-centered strategies.

5. Theoretical Contribution

This study contributes to the literature by extending the application of the CIPP model into the context of Arabic morphology learning in Islamic educational institutions, an area that remains relatively underexplored. While previous studies have widely applied the CIPP model in general education, vocational training, and curriculum evaluation, its use in evaluating *sharaf*-based language programs provides new insights into how traditional linguistic pedagogy can be systematically assessed.

Furthermore, this study demonstrates that memorization-based pedagogy remains relevant in Arabic learning, but its effectiveness depends on integration with modern instructional strategies and learner-centered approaches. This finding aligns with recent evaluations emphasizing that successful educational programs require a balance between traditional methods and technological innovation. Finally, this study highlights that program effectiveness in Islamic education is shaped by the interaction between institutional alignment, pedagogical design, and learner internal factors, thereby offering a more holistic perspective on educational evaluation within the CIPP framework.

CONCLUSION

خاتمة

Based on the evaluation using the CIPP model (Context, Input, Process, Product), the wazan sharaf memorization program at Ma'had Hasan Bin Ali Samarinda demonstrates a generally positive contribution to students' Arabic language competence, particularly in mastering morphological patterns. From the context aspect, the program aligns well with the institution's vision and mission, although it remains non-formal and lacks official curricular status. In terms of input, the program is supported by competent instructors and adequate facilities, despite the need for more adaptive and multimodal learning resources. The process is implemented systematically through traditional talaqqi and memorization methods, supported by collaborative interaction, yet constrained by limited instructional time and minimal technology integration. From the product aspect, students demonstrate moderate learning achievement with variation in performance, influenced by differences in prior knowledge, learning motivation, and conceptual complexity. Overall, the program is relevant and effective at a foundational level, but requires further development to ensure sustainability and more equitable learning outcomes.

The findings of this study have important implications at both institutional and policy levels. At the institutional level, the program should be formally integrated into the Ma'had curriculum to ensure its sustainability, standardization, and accountability. At the pedagogical level, there is a need to adopt technology-enhanced learning strategies, such as the use of spaced repetition applications (e.g., Anki) for memorizing wazan patterns, interactive platforms (e.g., Quizizz or Kahoot) to increase student engagement, and the development of digital modules incorporating

audio-visual elements to support pronunciation and retention. At a broader level, this study suggests that policymakers in Islamic educational institutions should encourage the integration of traditional memorization approaches with modern instructional technologies, thereby creating a more balanced and effective Arabic language learning system.

This study has several limitations. First, the relatively small sample size ($n = 23$) limits the generalizability of the findings, indicating that the results should be interpreted within a specific institutional context. Second, the absence of pre-test data restricts the ability to measure learning improvement over time, and therefore the findings are limited to describing learning achievement. Third, the reliance on traditional instructional methods without systematic technology integration may influence the effectiveness of the program. Based on these limitations, future research is recommended to involve larger and more diverse samples, apply pre-test and post-test designs for stronger measurement of learning gains, and explore the effectiveness of integrating digital learning tools, such as flashcard-based applications, mobile learning platforms, and interactive multimedia modules, in enhancing students' mastery of wazan sharaf.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

مراجع

- Agus, A., Juliadharma, M., & Djamaluddin, M. (2023). Application of the CIPP model in evaluation of the inclusive education curriculum in Madrasah Aliyah. *Nidhomul Haq: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 8(1), 31–50.
- Ayyusufi, A. M., Anshori, A., & Muthoifin, M. (2022). Evaluation of the CIPP model on the tahfidz program in Islamic boarding schools. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 5(2), 466–484.
- Babadi, F., Esfandiari, M., & Cheraghi, M. (2024). Evaluating the dentistry program in Iran using the context, input, process, and product (CIPP) model: A comprehensive analysis. *Frontiers in Medicine*, 11, 1394395.
- Chanthalangsy, P., Yeh, B. I., Choi, S. J., & Park, Y. C. (2024). Program evaluation of postgraduate obstetrics and gynecology training in Lao People's Democratic Republic using the CIPP model. *BMC Medical Education*, 24(1), 44.
- Damayanti, E., Ibrahim, M. M., & Ismail, M. I. (2022). Evaluation of online learning programs at universities using the CIPP model. *Jurnal Educative: Journal of Educational Studies*, 6(1), 95–110.
- Fadli, M., & Muzayin, A. (2023). Wazan, mauzun, dan tashrif. *Bashrah: Jurnal Studi Bahasa Arab dan Kebahasaaraban*, 5(1), 15–28.
- Fan, X., Tian, S., Lu, Z., & Cao, Y. (2022). Quality evaluation of entrepreneurship education in higher education based on CIPP model and AHP-FCE methods. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 13, 973511.
- Fitriani, A. Z. (2021). Evaluasi program e-learning pada Prodi Pendidikan Bahasa Arab Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta dengan model CIPP. *Maharaat: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Arab*, 3(2), 101–112.
- Kheryadi. (2022). Evaluasi program public speaking "muhadarah" dengan model CIPP pada tingkat sekolah dasar. *Holistika: Jurnal Ilmiah PGSD*, 6(1), 55–64.

- Kurniawati, E. W. (2021). Evaluasi program pendidikan perspektif model CIPP. *Ghaita: Islamic Education Journal*, 2(1), 23–36.
- Li, Y., & Hu, C. (2022). The evaluation index system of teaching quality in colleges and universities: Based on the CIPP model. *Mathematical Problems in Engineering*, 2022(1), 3694744.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook* (3rd ed.). Sage.
- Mukarromah, L. (2022). *Evaluasi program character building berbasis model CIPP di Sekolah Alam Insan Kami Gowa* [Master's thesis, UIN Alauddin Makassar].
- Musolin, M., Fauzi, F., & Muflihin, H. (2023). Evaluating curriculum at Madrasah Aliyah: Applying the context, input, process, product (CIPP) model. *Al-Ishlah: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 15(4), 6737–6748.
- Pane, A. (2018). Urgensi bahasa Arab: Bahasa Arab sebagai alat komunikasi agama Islam. *Komunikologi: Jurnal Pengembangan Ilmu Komunikasi dan Sosial*, 2(1), 77–88.
- Ratnay, G., Indriaswuri, R., Widyanthi, D. G. C., Atmaja, I. M. P. D., & Dalem, A. A. (2022). CIPP evaluation model for vocational education: A critical review. *Education Quarterly Reviews*, 5(3), 1–8.
- Rejina, K. C., & Baral, P. (2023). Applying context, input, process and product (CIPP) model for course evaluation. *KMC Journal*, 5(1), 205–218.
- Shaheen, K. M., & Mahmood, S. T. (2024). Using CIPP model to evaluate online teacher training programme for single national curriculum, 2021. *International Research Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 5(1), 144–160.
- Stufflebeam, D. L. (2007). *Evaluation theory, models, & applications* (2nd ed.). Jossey-Bass.
- Sugiyono. (2019). *Metode penelitian pendidikan: Pendekatan kuantitatif, kualitatif, dan R&D*. Alfabeta.
- Suharman, S., & Rohman, N. (2022). Evaluation of the teaching skills enrichment program through the context input process product (CIPP) model. *Al-Bidayah: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Islam*, 14(2), 347–360.
- Suryana, D., Husna, A., & Mahyuddin, N. (2023). CIPP evaluation model: Analysis of education implementation in PAUD based on government policy on implementation of learning during the COVID-19 pandemic. *Jurnal Obsesi: Jurnal Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini*, 7(4), 4386–4396.
- Zahroh, M., Susarno, L. H., & Bachri, B. S. (2025). The CIPP model in training program evaluation: How effective is it? *Journal of Educational Technology Studies and Applied Research*, 2(1).
- Zhao, T., Yu, L., Jiang, X., Yang, S., Zhang, X., Zhang, M., & Xu, F. (2025). Construction of a public health practice teaching quality evaluation system based on the CIPP model using the analytic hierarchy process (AHP) and entropy weight method. *BMC Medical Education*, 25(1), 368.

