

THE DIALECTICS OF RELIGIOUS AND CULTURAL LIBERALISM IN THE TRANSCULTURAL ERA

Muhammad Fahmi Hidayatullah^{1}, Muhammad Anwar Firdaus²,
Yusuf Hanafi³, Zawawi Ismail⁴*

¹Universitas Islam Malang, Indonesia

²Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, Indonesia

³Universitas Negeri Malang, Indonesia

⁴University of Malaya, Malaysia

*Email: m.fahmihidayatullah@unisma.ac.id

Received: November 11, 2021

Accepted: December 13, 2021

Abstract

Trans culture is a cross-cultural condition which can develop or survive within the life of a community. Religion and culture as the pillars for unity in the cross-cultural era can potentially develop into liberalism. This study aims to reveal the process of religious and cultural liberalism along with the solutions. It uses a qualitative-analysis method with hermeneutic approach based on the thoughts of the figures of Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) in East Java. To collect the data, the researchers conduct in-depth interviews and data analysis of the works and news on religious and cultural liberalism. The study discovers the dialectic model of religious liberalism by making human rights the main source of law, which is called theological-capitalism. Besides, it finds cultural liberalism in the form of an identity crisis, which is called enculturation-liberalism. To overcome the religious liberalism, we can use clarification techniques and logical-systematic thinking. Meanwhile, the solution to deal with cultural liberalism is through cultural realism and socio-cultural learning.

Transkultural adalah kondisi lintas kebudayaan yang dapat berkembang atau bertahan di kehidupan masyarakat. Agama dan budaya sebagai pilar persatuan yang dalam era lintas kebudayaan berpotensi berkembang pada paham liberal. Tujuan penelitian ini mengungkap proses liberalisme agama dan budaya yang disertai solusi dalam menangkalnya. Metode penelitian yang digunakan adalah kualitatif-analisis dengan pendekatan hermeneutik berdasarkan pemikiran tokoh Ulama' NU Jawa Timur. Dalam menggali data, dilakukan wawancara mendalam serta analisis data dokumentatif karya dan berita liberalisme agama dan budaya. Hasil penelitian ditemukan model dialektika liberalisme agama dengan menjadikan Hak Asasi Manusia sebagai sumber hukum utama disebut teologis-kapitalistik, sedangkan dialektika liberalisme budaya dalam bentuk krisis identitas disebut enkulturasi-liberalistik. Solusi dalam menanggulangi liberalisme agama dengan menggunakan teknik klarifikasi dan berfikir logis-sistematis. Sedangkan solusi menghadapi liberalisme budaya melalui realisme culture dan socio-culture learning.

Keywords: *Dialectics; liberalism; religion; culture; trans culture*

Introduction

The dynamics of life requires humans to move otherwise they remain stagnant. Choosing to move and make a change means to meet the demand that requires to follow the rhythm of the current social and cultural development. Choosing to be stagnant means not to go with the flow and to counteract the dynamics of cross-cultural development called transculture. However, it is necessary to review the stagnant options to keep up with the current global developments because after all we will realize that globalization and cultural change are inevitable in life (Alam, 2014). The strength of cultural identity lies in cultural interaction, not cultural isolation (Sahlins, 1994).

The intensity of cultural interaction in global life tests the identity of human life and the environment by influencing each other (Suneki, 2012). It is similar to the dialectical concept of Hegel's philosophy of thought about theses-antitheses-syntheses related to acceptance, resistance, and compromise against global influences (Schnitker & Emmons, 2013). According to Durkheim (1973), social change must occur in people's lives. However, they should strive to compromise the moral values of society with social change considering morality as their fundamental identity. In essence, humans hold a high moral power, yet the social life leads to the relaxation of traditional and cultural values. Therefore, modern society means moral inconsistency (Ritzer et al., 2001).

Dramatically, societies all over the world transform along with globalization. Their cultural identity depend on the flow of globalization (Rizescu et al., 2017). Globalization has a massive effect on social change that can move a person or group of people or even a country. The reason is because globalization can affect human life in various aspects of life (Rizescu et al., 2017). One of the factors of globalization is the progress of science and technology (Yusuf, 2017). Besides, it can make it easier for foreign cultures to assimilate within the country. However, not all foreign cultures have a negative impact on a country. They can pose a positive impact if the society can survive with the basic foundation of life.

Culture lexically means habits (Hermawan et al., 2020). It is the identity that characterizes a nation. Therefore, a civilized nation will maintain, respect, and preserve the culture. The actions are taken to stem cross-cultural influences that come into this country freely. Basically, it is not easy to maintain, preserve, and determine the conception of Indonesian cultural criteria (Ruslan, 2015). *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika* as the nation's motto and *Pancasila* as the ideology are not enough to discuss Indonesian culture. *Pancasila* as the country's socio-political force strengthens the nation's understanding in treating local wisdom and responding to non-local wisdom (Hakim et al., 2012).

Culture and globalization are inseparable because both have a relationship in human social life (Alam, 2014). In addition, the unstoppable flow of globalization culture is opposed and even rejected because it has been deeply rooted in the mindset of the social community. The biggest challenge is the formation of a consumptive society in terms of both style and lifestyle. Therefore, what we can do is taking advantage of the globalization with people's mindsets to influence it (Yusuf, 2017).

It is a matter of pride for a country to maintain a culture, especially Indonesia, which is ethnically and culturally diverse. However, the diversity, on the other hand, invites big challenges (Indriyani, 2017). The challenge lies in the nation's capability to maintain local culture, so it remains upright and sustainable because a lot of developing countries are hegemonized by developed countries, especially in the aspect of culture that may lead to the identity loss. This is an era called *trans culture*, a challenge with the ability to struggle intrapersonally against cultural conflicts (Shahzad et al., 2021).

According to Shahzad et al. (2021), it is necessary to practice self-criticism and tolerate differences through developing interpersonal and psychological skills as well as collaborating with patients' families and peers. Furthermore, Lin

et al. (2017), noted that to measure transcultural self-efficacy, comprehensive resources that can evaluate cultural awareness, sensitivity, knowledge and skills are required. Meanwhile, heterogeneity can be accurately accepted, and students adapt as a form of cultural care in the transcultural era (Vázquez-Sánchez et al., 2021).

For Indonesia, with majority Muslim population, identity in the globalization era becomes a problem which is getting stronger and stronger (Mujahidin, 2015). The portrait of changes in the social life of the Muslim community is motivated by the transcultural era in a global context considered biased about western culture. Many examples can be witnessed together, such as the weakening of Islamic identity which is so called, liberalism (Muridan, 2018), the identity crisis leading to radicalism, and even the more concrete one, terrorism, with the stigma of Islam as an anti-globalization religion (Sahasrad, 2018).

The examples above show that the challenges of the transcultural era is getting more acute for liberalization and radicalization motives. The motives are made in various ways, mainly through culture. Therefore, it is necessary to find a strategy in facing the challenges of the globalization era in which a culture can traverse freely within the framework of *Bhineka Tunggal Ika*. This strategy aims to stem covert efforts that influence the nations to experience a decantation of identity or culture.

Method

The researchers adopt a descriptive-analytical qualitative research approach (Bakri, 2013) with a hermeneutic case study based on the thoughts of NU scholars in East Java regarding the dialectic of religion and culture in the transcultural era for the Indonesian people. The data are collected through in-depth interviews with NU leaders in East Java. It is also done through written documentation based on the writings of moderate Muslim scholars.

Results and Discussion

Historiography and Philosophy of Religious Liberalism in the Transcultural Era

Western hegemony towards developing countries is still running massively (Ruslan, 2015). A lot of countries suffer hegemony, especially the developing ones, leading to the idea of ignorance to the states and religious norms. This behavior reflects the nation's identity loss, which is manifested in the loss

of character and the spirit of nationalism (Suneki, 2012). Meanwhile, our nation has been characterized as a friendly, open, tolerant, moderate, and peaceful country.

Maintaining identity is an obligation of every nation. The challenge comes during the era in which all cultures can traverse across countries. Pancasila as a consensus (a mutual agreement among groups) should be a force for social unity (Mujahidin, 2015). Various challenges that arise can be muffled by double loyalty between social units. The transcultural era has a relationship with the concept of western hegemony, including triggering the emergence of liberalism. The liberal ideology that emerged with the principle of freedom is very relevant to the transcultural era (Saifuddin, 2016), where every human being is free to express his innovation and creativity to either influence or benefit from others. This is something that needs to be watched out, especially when the concept of liberalism is associated with religion (Khozin, interviewer, 2018). The dilemma of Islamic liberalization in particular has become a trend of national issues since 2001 to date. The issues that have been studied by the researchers are still very interesting. The issue of liberalism does not only have an impact on the behavior or activities of religious practice but also the behavior of the cultured nation and state.

The concepts of Liberalism and Islam are two words that cannot be combined. Liberalism is an understanding of freedom in various aspects, both thoughts and actions which lead to the expectation of human rights (Khozin, interview, 2018). Meanwhile, Islam is a religion of mercy (compassion) for all humans on this earth, especially those who believe (Rasyid, 2016). Islam and liberalism are always in conflict because the orientation of the movement is freedom of expression on the basis of one's own will (Hadziq, 2018). Meanwhile, Islam concerns on the values of unity, humanity, and social justice. Therefore, it is necessary to examine the nature of liberalism and its characteristics so that we do not fall into the wrong path.

In addition, the concepts of liberalism and inclusivism also have different meanings although they have some similarities at the level of implementation. Liberalism promotes freedom while inclusivism teaches openness. The similarity lies in the fact that they both pay attention to human rights. However, in practice liberalism tends to prioritize personal ego over the interests of the majority of people or the interests of a rule. Meanwhile, inclusivism prioritizes human values about unity and integrity by making the rules at the top level while human rights lie below it (Khozin, interview, 2018).

The majority fail to understand the opinions of traditional scholars about religion and tenet, which aim to unite by confirming that every religion teaches about goodness. Believing that every religion has the value of goodness is a form of inclusivism, so there is no need to argue and blame one another, which may result in the collapse of the diversity concept. Islam teaches a religion of grace with the principle of openness (inclusiveness) inherent in diversity (Kuncoro, 2019).

While justifying every creed of all religions is a form of liberalism, to understand more deeply it is important for students, lecturers, teachers, researchers, community leaders, and scientists to concern on it more deeply.

The Phenomenon of Cultural Liberalism in the Transcultural Era within the Context of Bhinika Tunggal Ika

The fact that foreign culture can easily influence society highly affects the development of the nation's culture, especially Indonesia (Ruslan, 2015). The current cultural flows cannot be separated from globalization. The impact is the waning of the preservation of the nation's cultural values due to the rapid flow of technology and information. More specifically, the development of telecommunications and transportation along with the technological advances which leads to the lack of the society interest in preserving their own culture. For example, there are aspects of language, clothing, and food which continuously experience drastic changes among society.

In the use of language, there happens a strong shift, especially among the younger generation. The shift is influenced by foreign powers which destroy the indigenous traditions and languages. A concrete example of the tradition of the Indonesian nation, the era of 90s, people tightly hold manners (*unggah-ungguh*) upon their daily communication, primarily to the older generation. However, in contrast to the current conditions, since the 20th century, there has been a shift in language manners among the younger generation (Sudarmawan, 2005). The ethics and unwritten norms among society are also ignored.

The concrete example of the problem of using language is the Indonesian people who no longer respect Indonesian and regional languages even though they the assets of the nation's culture. The problem of using Indonesian, for example, is that it no longer uses standard language or good language. In fact, the authenticity of Indonesian as a mother tongue should be maintained. The occurrence of changes in words in Indonesian has become common because

for the younger generation, the changes are considered slang. One example of the mention of the words *me* and *you* is replaced with *gue* (I) and *lu* (you).

In addition, the problem faced by the Indonesian in the context of language is the inability of students to use their mother tongue. Some students in Jakarta International School find difficulty speaking Indonesian. Based on data from the Head of the Association of Indonesian Language Teachers and Activists for Foreign Speakers (APPBIPA), who is also the dean of the Faculty of Languages and Arts, Universitas Negeri Jakarta, 70% of Indonesian students are unable or difficult to speak Indonesian. It happens because the students are accustomed to communicating in English as the first language at school (Suro, 2018). It is very ironic, considering that Indonesian Bahasa is a mother tongue. And, it happens to the majority of international schools in Indonesia.

Furthermore, it is getting worse in the context of regional language. Very few students can speak their local language, such as Krama Inggil in Javanese, whereas it teaches the younger generation to respect those who are older. In addition, this local language is a cultural heritage whose value is incalculable. The inability of the nation, especially the younger generation, to use the local language is influenced by the entry of foreign cultures (English, Arabic, Mandarin, etc.) which is not followed by strengthening the values of local wisdom.

The need for strengthening local languages functions as an anticipation its loss, replaced by foreign languages. The statistics of the Central Bureau mentions that there are 71 regional languages whose vitality has been mapped, revealing 11 regional languages are extinct, 19 languages are threatened with extinction, and 2 regional languages are in critical. In addition, the Head of the Indonesian Language Agency emphasized that Indonesia is a country that has the second most regional languages in the world after Papua New Guinea (Saputra, 2018). This potential should be utilized by caring for and preserving it. The development is through various cultural events and festivals that can attract the attention of foreign tourists to participate in studying Bahasa.

The ability of the Indonesian people to use regional languages aims to show the identity of the country in which there is a polite and civilized nation. But the younger generations ignore it. Therefore, they are one of the causes of the loss of regional languages because they are reluctant to learn and use them. This problem must be the main concern of teachers and parents because parents who deal with children every day and have the obligation to

teach children their mother tongue (Indonesian and regional languages) since the early childhood.

Secondly, in the clothing aspect, that a lot of citizens follow the western and middle eastern trends in fashion (Hidayah, 2021). Indonesians can easily imitate the identity of other countries. A concrete example is in small towns and big cities that use bikini clothes, which are typical of America, or Korean hair styles or Saudi Arabian veils. This phenomenon actually undermines the identity of the nation as a civilized nation accustomed to upholding the value of politeness in fashion.

The impact of the use or selection of clothing has an effect on human morals and behavior because the clothes reflect the identity. The association begins by imitating a western culture, one of which is dressing in a bikini with a mini skirt, which attracts the attention of the men to do violence. In general, the problem of minimal and tight clothing to show off the curves of the body usually happens to the youth in the big cities. They are inspired by Indonesian magazines and films adopted from abroad. In addition, the rapid flow of information and open technology has contributed to changes in the dressing and socializing styles of Indonesian youth. The influence of western culture that affects the dressing style of Indonesian teenagers is successful because they are well received by the Indonesian. However, it leads to the decline of the morality of the nations who are supposed to be nationalist and religious.

The Indonesia Police Watch (IPW), reported that in 2017, 178 babies has been born and dumped on the street. 79 of them are in captivity, 10 fetuses are not yet born but forced to be born or aborted and then thrown along the street. The rest are found alive. This number increases by 90 cases compared to the previous year. Based on the number of cases, 27 cases occur in Jakarta, 24 cases in East Java, and 23 cases in West Java (Yamin, 2018).

The above issue needs a serious concern, considering that Java is known for the island with a lot of scholars and students. It is obviously a challenge for religious leaders and parents to raise public awareness on the detrimental culture to avoid. Some of the trends that lead to the emergence of violence are wearing bikini or mini-skirts, Korean style, and Middle Eastern clothing. Therefore, teenagers need to learn from the small things which might trigger sexual desire. The way to do this is not to follow the flow of foreign cultures that pass through the country. Choosing clothes that show the identity of the Indonesian, such as the national batik, is the best way to anticipate the above

issue. Using batik can invite the aura of personal authority of teenagers in addition to participating in Indonesian cultural campaign.

The third is in the food aspect. We are faced with typical western cuisines that try to enter and dominate the country's market share. In addition, the interest of the younger generation for these foods is very high. Today's young generation aged 15-34 years prefer fast food over the traditional one (a survey by the Health Education Authority, 2002). In addition, data based on a Mastercard survey conducted in 2015 titled Consumer Purchasing Priorities, 80% of Indonesians choose cuisine at fast food outlets, 61% choose hawker centers or food courts, 22% choose to eat at middle-class restaurants or cafes, and 1% choose to eat at low-class restaurants or cafes (Arista, 2016). Therefore, the presence of various models and concepts of foreign food has an impact on the loss of traditional specialties.

This problem is a common concern, especially as a nation that loves national identity. The impact of the above problems also affects the economic conditions of the Indonesian. We all should know that many Indonesian have gone out of business in the traditional food and beverage. In fact, Indonesia is known as an agrarian country, one of the world's largest agricultural producers. The spirit of food sovereignty and independence, which is continuously inflamed by the minister of agriculture that targets Indonesia in 2045 as the world's food barn (Hulwa, 2018). This target should be supported by the participation of the community who are producers of the culinary business by participating in campaigning for traditional cuisine. In addition, it also needs the support of the Indonesian people who become consumers by continuously consuming traditional dishes. However, for those of the upper middle class who are trying to serve traditional cuisine, they have to deal with modern-western cuisine which is starting to be in great demand by the majority of modern society.

Meanwhile, for small and medium-sized communities, a tight competition occurs in traditional markets. There is very little public interest in consuming traditional dishes of the lower and middle class. People should return to consuming foods, such as *tiwul*, *getuk*, *lemet*, *lanting*, *cemplon* and so on. All of these foods use cassava as the basic ingredient. And, the reason why should cassava be the main priority as a product of the country's food sovereignty is that Indonesia is the third world's largest cassava producing countries in 2012 (Tempo.co, 2011).

Therefore, based on the very complex transcultural problem, this country requires a concrete solution to find a way out of the shackles of foreign culture.

The complexity of the problems will lead the country to the glory. One of the forms of the state glory is the transformation into a developed country. In addition, developed countries have the ability to incorporate their values and culture into foreign countries. Thus, the cultural identity of the country can spread massively in various parts of the world, especially developing countries which have always been the market share of developed countries.

Strategies to Deal with Religious Liberalism in the Transcultural Era

Islamic liberalism has become a polemic that disturbs the peace of coexistence in the country. Liberalism needs to be watched out and warned. Once nobody cares about it, everyone will play with religion according to their will under human rights (Khozin, interview, 2018). It is certainly very fatal if associated with religion because religion basically guides the path of human life, not humans who guide the flow of religion. If it happens, humans will dictate the journey of religion so that everyone who performs worship is based on their own interpretation, belief, and will. The opinion of other people who are more knowledgeable or more famous is not a consideration in making legal decisions.

Therefore, liberal understanding needs to be vigilant so as not to create a conflict that disturbs the harmonization of the life of the nation and state. Moderate Islam is actually a solution to the practice of Indonesian Islamic religion. Its relevance to Pancasila ideology is beyond doubt. However, the solution to stem the development of Indonesian Islamic liberalism other than the moderate thinking model is a clarification technique as the data obtained by the researchers.

The stages of clarification techniques based on the results of interviews include: providing insight into positive religious thoughts, conducting discussions by introducing the advantages and disadvantages of positive material that he has learned, and mapping the best values to be used as permanent knowledge based on his steadfastness. Clarification technique is an alternative solution to straighten someone's understanding that is contradictory. The clarification technique is a method used to help someone in deciding the value to choose (Muhaimin, 2004). Basically, for those who think liberally, one of the causes is the inability to choose or decide religious teachings that are *kaffah* based on *Ahlussunnah Wal Jama'ah*.

In the view of the researchers, religious liberalism views religious issues as personal problems that a person cannot regulate the way and direction of

his/her religion even though the religion is the same. If this is the case, inter-religious conflict will emerge as a new problem that will abort the support of fellow religions. The impact is that people who need the help of brothers and sisters in the faith cannot be protected. The stages of using clarification techniques in Muhamim's opinion (2002) include: 1) introducing good values and examples and students being directly involved, 2) telling the advantages and disadvantages of the values he has taught through discussion and question and answer to make a choice that he thinks the best, 3) classifying the best values based on their best choices for personal consumption in life (Muhaimin, 2004).

In addition to the clarification technique, the second solution is logical, rational and systematic thinking technique strengthened by evaluating the form of thinking as stated by KH. Agus Muhammad Zaki Hadziq that liberalism is not a threatening ideology, but we need to be alerted to the thoughts that are contrary to the ideology of Pancasila because Pancasila does not teach us to think liberally. Indeed, ideological deviations cannot be cured simply by socialization activities and seminars. However, it takes precise steps to solve it. One example is the technique of logical, rational, and systematic thinking, yet the process goes through 4 stages, 1) those who are liberal show contradictory values of their liberal thinking (in essence it brings up values that are contrary to their thinking), 2) inviting a dialogue in small groups with a companion, 3) is invited to dialogue in large groups, 4) reflection process. Essentially, it provides them the opportunity to voice their arguments based on the dilemma of liberalism to improve their ideas through *muhasabah* (Hadziq, interview, 2018).

This solution corresponds with the moral reasoning technique in one of Muhamim's theories about affective learning techniques in PAI, where there are stages that must be carried out, including: 1) presenting contradictory moral problems and observing them, 2) creating small groups to discuss the results of observations, 3) creating large group discussions to communicate the results of small group discussions followed by a clarification process and creating alternative solutions and consequences, 4) organizing the value of the chosen alternative (Muhaimin, 2004).

The two kinds of solutions are recommended in dealing with the development of liberal Islamic thought. They are related to the act of *amar ma'ruf* as contained in Islamic teachings that every Muslim has an obligation to invite good deeds. If there found a Muslim who deviates from his/her teachings, other Muslims are obliged to straighten him/her out.

Solutions to Face Cultural Liberalism in the Transcultural Era in the Context of Diversity

Transcultural issues should be used as opportunities, not challenges because this era is ideal to explore the identity and culture of a country. Every country wishes to promote their culture so they are recognized as a pilot nation. This potential can attract foreigners to come and visit the country. To preserve the culture and avoid global challenges, a solution is required, which can be through cultural realism and socio-cultural learning.

Cultural realism is an effort to display a culture in life naturally. This effort can preserve the nation's culture sustainably while introducing national identity to foreigners. This method can strengthen the basic foundation of the nation to always preserve culture without being influenced by foreign cultures. In addition, it can raise people's awareness on the importance of the local culture. This view concerns the customary law among society that regulates human life, concerning the aspects of ethics, manners, and customs.

In its historical development, cultural realism has bound a person to a lifestyle to shackle a view of life among individual or groups. Every action is based on their thought. The mind has the potential for higher-order thinking and distinguishes it from other creatures. Humans as perfect beings who are different from other creatures, are equipped with reason and lust to determine the orientation of their lives. Humans have the authority to direct their life processes. It is through the provision of reason that humans have the ability to understand their nature, understand the meaning of life and the meaning of their existence among nature and other living things.

Therefore, human can determine a meaningful pattern of life without being influenced by other patterns including other cultures. Cultural realism aims to display Indonesian culture in various aspects of life without any influence of western culture. A concrete example of applying the local language in life is displaying batik and sarongs as a national identity. The use of batik clothes and sarongs educates the younger generation to become polite and authoritative individuals. With this habit, they are protected from mini clothes that can invite other's desire.

Besides, socio-cultural learning is another recommend effort to do. The learning process can be in the classroom or outside the classroom with various fun activities. Tylor argues that there are three dimensions that have similarities and are related, including: humans, society and culture (Tilaar, 2002). Therefore, the education and learning process carried out by humans

cannot be separated from the dimensions of culture and a community. Culture supports the realization of community identity while the community as the executor of the formation of a culture that has been formed by humans or social groups of society. Culture is an important dimension in achieving the learning objectives.

Socio-cultural learning is one of the four principles of learning (Triyanto, 2011). It emphasizes the process of social and cultural interaction with other people. It seeks to fuse cultural values among social groups. The goal is that the community is affected and bound by the existing culture. This learning also teaches a person to be a human being who cares and empathizes with others. The reason is that culture can unite the differences among society. It can strengthen the love for the national identity of the nation and state.

Conclusion

The plurality of religions and cultures is the identity of the Indonesian nation. Adaptation to global challenges through the transcultural era must be made. The study discovers the dialectic model of religious liberalism by making human rights the main source of law, which is called theological-capitalism. Besides, it finds cultural liberalism in the form of an identity crisis, which is called enculturation-liberalism. To overcome the religious liberalism, we can use clarification techniques and logical-systematic thinking. Meanwhile, the solution to deal with cultural liberalism is through cultural realism and socio-cultural learning.

References

- Alam, B. (2014). Globalisasi dan Perubahan Budaya: Perspektif Teori Kebudayaan. *Antropologi Indonesia*, 1-11.
- Arista, D. (2016). *Tren Terbaru: Masyarakat Indonesia Lebih Suka Makanan Cepat Saji*. Tribunnews.com.
- Durkheim, E. (1973). *Moral Education; A Study in the Theory and Application of the Sociology of Education*. Free Press.
- Hadziq (Interviewer), A. M. Z. (2018). *Dinamika Negara Demokrasi: Problematika Dan Solusi Terhadap Perkembangan Paham Liberalisme Islam Indonesia (Studi Atas Pemikiran Ulama' PWNU Jawa Timur)*.

- Hakim, Abdul; Giovani, G. (2012). Perbandingan Perekonomian Dari Masa Soekarno Hingga Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono (1945 - 2009). *Jurnal Ekonomika Bisnis*, 3(2), 161–180. <https://doi.org/10.22219/jekobisnis.v3i2.2238>
- Hermawan, I., Ruswandi, U., & Erihadiana, M. (2020). the Concept of Management of Learning Mkwu Pai Based on Multicultural Components. *Tadib: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 9(1), 63–76. <https://doi.org/10.29313/tjpi.v9i1.6233>
- Hidayah, S. N. (2021). Pesantren for Middle-Class Muslims Hidayah, S. N. (2021). Pesantren for Middle-Class Muslims in Indonesia (Between Religious Commodification and Pious Neoliberalism). *QIJIS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)*, 9(1), 209–244. <https://doi.org/10.21043/QIJIS.V9I1.7641>
- Hulwa, R. A. (2018). *Mentan: Indonesia Lumbung Pangan Dunia 2045*. Finance. Detik.Com.
- Indriyany, I. A. (2017). Keberagaman Beragama Sebagai Tantangan Mewujudkan Masyarakat Multikultural. *Jurnal Polinter*, 2(2), 20–30.
- Khozin, M. (2018). *Dinamika Negara Demokrasi : Problematika Dan Solusi Terhadap Perkembangan Paham Liberalisme Islam Indonesia (Studi Atas Pemikiran Ulama' PWNNU Jawa Timur)*.
- Kuncoro, A. T. (2019). Penguatan Nilai Moderasi dan Kultural Beragama Bagi Umat Islam dalam Kehidupan Berbangsa. *Conference on Islamic Studies FAI 2019*, 98–108.
- Lin, C. J., Lee, C. K., & Huang, M. C. (2017). Cultural Competence of Healthcare Providers: A Systematic Review of Assessment Instruments. *The Journal of Nursing Research: JNR*, 25(3), 174–186. <https://doi.org/10.1097/JNR.000000000000153>
- Muhaimin. (2004). *Paradigma Pendidikan Islam: Upaya Mengefektifkan Pendidikan Agama Islam di Sekolah*. Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Mujahidin, A. (2015). Umat Beragama Sebagai Masyarakat Beradab : Identitas Agama vs Kebangsaan. *Jurnal Kalam*, 9(1), 17–30.

- Muridan. (2018). Fenomena Fashion Dalam Pertarungan Identitas Muslimah (Studi Komunikasi Fashion Mahasiswa IAIN Purwokerto dalam Penggunaan Busana Muslimah Sebagai Identitas Sosial Dan Seksual). *Yin Yang*, 13(2), 285–307.
- Rasyid, M. M. (2016). Islam Rahmatan Lil Alamin Perspektif Kh. Hasyim Muzadi. *Epistemé: Jurnal Pengembangan Ilmu Keislaman*, 11(1), 93–116. <https://doi.org/10.21274/epis.2016.11.1.93-116>
- Ritzer, George; Smart, B. (2001). *Handbook of Social Theory*. Sage Publication.
- Rizescu, Alexandru; Tileag, C. (2017). The Effects Of Globalization On The Transformation Of Organizational Management. *Journal of Defense Resources Management*, 8(1), 135–140.
- Ruslan, I. (2015). Penguatan Ketahanan Budaya dalam Menghadapi Derasnya Arus Budaya Asing. *Jurnal TAPIS*, 11(1), 1–19.
- Sahlins, M. (1994). Goodbye to Tristes Tropique: Ethnography in the Context of Modern World History. In *Assessing Cultural Anthropology*. McGraw-Hill.
- Sahasrad, H. A. C. (2018). Indonesian Terrorist, ISIS, and Globalization of Terror: A Perspective. *Journal Ahkam*, 18(1), 1–22.
- Saifuddin. (2016). Memposisikan Santri Dalam Pemikiran Liberal Keagamaan Di Indonesia. *Sosiologi Reflektif*, 10(2).
- Saputra, R. D. (2018). *Badan Bahasa: 11 Bahasa Daerah Puhah, 19 Terancam, dan 2 Kritis*. Liputan6.Com.
- Schnitker, S. A., & Emmons, R. A. (2013). Hegel's Thesis-Antithesis-Synthesis Model. *Encyclopedia of Sciences and Religions*, 978–978. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4020-8265-8_200183
- Shahzad, S., Ali, N., Younas, A., & Tayaben, J. L. (2021). Challenges and approaches to transcultural care: An integrative review of nurses' and nursing students' experiences. *Journal of Professional Nursing*, 37(6), 1119–1131. <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.PROFNURS.2021.10.001>
- Sudarmawan, H. (2005). *Tingkat tutur bahasa jawa krama pada generasi muda sinoman di kecamatan Grogol kabupaten Sukoharjo*. Universitas Sebelas Maret Surakarta.

- Suneki, S. (2012). *Dampak Globalisasi Terhadap Eksistensi Budaya Daerah*. II(1), 307–321.
- Suro, E. T. (2018). *Bahasa Indonesia yang Terlupakan di Sekolah Internasional Jakarta*. Liputan6.Com.
- Tempo.co. (2011). *Tiga Negara Asia Berpotensi Jadi Tujuan Ekspor Singkong*. Bisnis.Tempo.Co.
- Tilaar, H. A. . (2002). *Pendidikan Kebudayaan dan masyarakat Madani Indonesia*. Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Triyanto. (2011). *Mendesain Model Pembelajaran Inovatif-Progresif: Konsep Landasan, Implementasi Pada Kurikulum Tingkat Satuan Pendidikan (Ktsp)*. Kencana.
- Vázquez-Sánchez, M. Á., Casals, C., Casals-Vázquez, A., García-Barrios, S., Fernández-de-Canete, F., & Sánchez-Ojeda, M. A. (2021). Cultural adaptation and validation of the Transcultural Self-Efficacy Tool for use with undergraduate nursing students in Spain. *Nurse Education Today*, 107, 105106. <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.NEDT.2021.105106>
- Yamin, M. (2018). *Kasus Bayi Dibuang Meningkat, Seks Bebas Mengkhawatirkan*. Nasional.Sindonews.Com.
- Yusuf, C. F. (2017). Nasionalisme dalam Teks Keagamaan Indonesia Masa Depan. *Jurnal Lektur Keagamaan*, 15(2), 493–513.