

A CRITICAL STUDY OF THE CONCEPT OF SANAD NAHJ AL-BALAGHAH AS AN EFFORT TO BUILD TABAYYUN'S CULTURE IN ISLAMIC SCHOLARSHIP

Agus Hasan Bashori¹ dan Ulil Amri Syafri²

¹Ma'had Ali al-Aimmah; ²Pascasarjana UIKA;

Email: abu_hamzah@msn.com

Abstract

Tabayyun or tatsabbut or tahaqquq (verification) and taakkud (confirmation) of the news are important in order to prevent doing something wrong, injustice and regret. While in science and religion, tatsabbut is more important because the consequences could be dangerous. Therefore, Muslims as ummatan wasatan have been given by God the privilege to be the people whose religion and science have sanad. At the time of the salaf, tatsabbut with sanad was common through talaqqi and historical verification. In order to revive the culture of this tatsabbut, it needs a critical study on the sanad concept in a famous and wide spread of Nahj al-Balaghah book. The research questions are, how is the concept of sanad in the book Nahj al-Balagha? Does Nahj al-Balagha contain the belief of tasyayyu 'Ghali (Rafidhah) and bara'ah (seperating themselves) from the prophet's companions? This research used qualitative method, through a literature review and a descriptive documentary analysis. The finding shows that the book Nahj al-Balagha doesn't have sanad and its concept. Furthermore its content rejects and hates the companions of the Prophet and his wives.

Tabayyun atau tatsabbut atau tahaqquq (verifikasi) dan taakkud (konfirmasi) dalam berita adalah penting agar kita tidak berbuat salah, zalim dan menyesal. Sedangkan dalam ilmu dan agama tatsabbut itu lebih penting lagi sebab akibatnya bisa lebih fatal. Oleh karena itu umat Islam yang dijadikan oleh Allah sebagai

ummattan wasatan diberi keistimewaan sebagai umat yang agama dan ilmunya ber-sanad. Di zaman salaf, tatsabbut dengan sanad sudah membudaya dalam talaqqi dan riwayat. Maka untuk menghidupkan kembali budaya tatsabbut ini peneliti memandang perlu melakukan studi kritis terhadap konsep sanad yang ada dalam kitab Nahj al-Balaghah yang kesohor dan tersebar luas itu. Maka rumusan masalahnya adalah bagaimana konsep sanad dalam kitab Nahj al-Balaghah? Apakah Nahj Balaghah berisi akidah tasyayyu' ghali (Rafidhah) dan bara'ah (berlepas diri) dari para sahabat Nabi? Penelitian ini menggunakan metode kualitatif, melalui kajian literatur atau kepustakaan dan analisis dokumen secara deskriptif. Hasilnya, kita mendapatkan bahwa kitab Nahj al-Balaghah tidak memiliki sanad dan tidak memiliki konsep sanad, dan isinya menolak dan membenci para sahabat Nabi, dan istri-istrinya.

Keywords: *concept; culture; Nahj al-Balaghah; sanad; tabayyun.*

Introduction

Science has a very important role in building a society or nation. A nation that has a strong scientific tradition will have a great influence on other nations that are much larger in number and stronger in army. For example, the Greeks were a nation that loved science. Therefore, the influence of the scientific results of the Greeks was so influential on other nations, one of which was the Romans (Nasir, 2012). More than that, the Jahiliyah Arabs eventually became world leaders because of the science brought by the Prophet Muhammad PBUH. With this Islamic science, the Arabs who were originally illiterate and poor could defeat the Persians and Romans in a short time.

All knowledge that is beneficial to humans and does not contradict the guidance brought by the Prophet Muhammad PBUH is part of Islamic science. Therefore, the existing knowledge is used to recognize Allah swt., believe in Him, love Him, and obey Him in order to get happiness in this world and in the hereafter. This naqli Islamic science is conveyed through a sanad which is a specialty and characteristic of the people of the Prophet Muhammad SAW. The sanad of Islamic science starts from Allah, who is then brought by Gabriel to the Prophet Muhammad SAW. which is then passed on to his companions to be conveyed to humans after them. This method was not used by the previous nations in learning their religion, because of which there was a lot of *tahrif* (deviation) in

their books (Taimiyyah, 1999: 3/26-27, 6/349; Hindi, t.t.: 1/111, 2/425-625, 650, 617)

Linguistically, sanad is *mu'tamad* (backrest) (Manzhur, t.t.). Meanwhile verb *سَنَّ* or *اسَنَّ* means *صَعِدَ أَوْ رَقِيَ* (up) (Zamakhshari: t.t.: 300). In terms of Hadith scholars, the sanad is: "The path that leads to the message" (Anshari, t.t.: 1/16). What is meant by the path is: "The line of narrators who transmit the hadith in a chain from one person to another, from the first source, i.e., the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him and his progeny) or those lower than him, i.e., the Companions or the Taabi'in." (Qari, t.t.: 18-19).

Whereas *Matan*, according to language is said: "*مَثْنُ أَلْفًا وَصَلْبُهُ*" (The *matan* of something is its hard core), it says: "*مَتَّنَتِ الدَّابَّةَ لِلْغَايَةِ*" (He took him deep into the goal) (Manzhur, t.t.). In terms, Badruddin ibn Jama'ah said: "Matan is the speech (news) reached by the end of the sanad" (Jama'ah, t.t.).

The word *Isnad* is a noun formed from *asnada* which means leaning. In terms explained by Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani said: "*Isnad* is a narration (telling) of the course of the *matan*" (Asqalani, t.t.). The meaning of *hikayat* is to tell the path of transmission to its first source.

Hadith scholars are very concerned with the *Isnad* because it is the way to find out the traditions of the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) which is the second source of Islam after the Quran. By tracing the bearers of this news it will be known which news is authentic and which is invalid. The scholars say that the Hadith is half the science of hadith because hadith consists of the part of *Isnad* and *matan* (Fayyadh, 2007: 133).

Allah swt. said:

﴿يَتَأَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ ءَامَنُوا إِن جَاءَكُمْ فَاسِقٌ بِنَبَأٍ فَتَبَيَّنُوا أَن تُصِيبُوا قَوْمًا بِجَهْلَةٍ فَتُصِيبُوا عَلَى مَا فَعَلْتُمْ تَدْمِيمًا﴾ ﴿٦﴾ الحجرات: ٦

O you who believe, if a wicked person comes to you with news, then you should do tabayyun (research about the veracity of the news), so that you do not bring calamity on a people without knowing their situation, as a result you will regret what you did. (Q.S: al-Hujurat: 6).

The Prophet said:

"Whoever lies against me intentionally then please take his seat from hell" (Bukhari, t.t.: 1/33 no. 107; Naisaburi, t.t.: 1/10, 4/2298 no. 3004; Rifa'i, t.t.: 1/9). "Whoever narrates from me a tradition that is suspected to be false is one of the two liars" (Naisaburi, t.t.: 1/8). While the Prophet (peace be upon him) announced paradise for the one who relates a tradition correctly, memorizing it according to what he heard (Sijistani, t.t.: 3/322 no. 3660; Turmudzi, 1975: 5/34).

The hadiths of the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) above show that the concept of *sanad* in Islam is very important because it is one of the traditions in Islamic science. This concept is in accordance with the spirit of the check and recheck method in the scientific concept in the Western world. Detailed scientific investigation makes a scientific work strong and reliable so that the results can be utilized for the benefit of science.

Related to that, researchers feel interested in examining the book of *Nahj al-Balaghah*, one of the famous literary books written by Sharif Radhi, namely Abu al-Hasan Muhammad bin Abi Ahmad ath-Thahir al-Husain bin Musa al-Abrasi bin Muhammad al-A'raj bin Musa (Abu Sabhah) bin Ibrahim al-Ashghar bin Imam Musa bin Imam Ja'far as-Sadiq, one of the great Shia scholars who was also a prominent poet in his day. In this book, Sharif Radhi relates that Imam Ali was the most prolific poet and literary expert at the birthplace of *balaghah* (Hadid, 1965: 45).

The Shias believe that the *Nahj al-Balaghah* is the most complete book in compiling what they consider to be part of the science inherited from Imam Ali, as well as the holiest book after the Quran. This was expressed by Imam Khumaini in his political will which he claimed to be "*Ilahiyyah*". (Khumaini, t.t.; Anonymous (Iranian Embassy in Jakarta), t.t.: 79).

Nahj al-Balaghah has been published in many languages, including Indonesian. In Indonesia itself, this book has been translated with various versions from Mizan, YAPI Bangil, Lentera, al-Huda Jakarta, Cahaya Bogor, and Trisula Adisakti Jakarta. Of these six publishers, there are two whose books are published as references to the PAI curriculum in elementary schools. One of them is Mizan publisher and its group that dominates KTSP 2006 and Curriculum 2013. (Bashori, 2016: 7-8)

The author has conducted a literature review covering four scientific works on *Nahj al-Balaghah* (1 thesis, 11 theses, and 3 dissertations) derived from

Iraq, Palestine, Malaysia, and Indonesia in relation to linguistic and semiotic research. The results show that all scholars believe that Nahj al-Balaghah is authentic from Imam Ali and agree on its beauty. (Bashori, 2016: 14-20).

However, none of these studies have criticized the content of Nahj al-Balaghah in Shari'i terms, even though the Prophet Muhammad PBUH once commented on a preacher who said right in language but wrong in Shari'i manners, "*The worst preacher is you, say: Whoever disobeys Allah and His Messenger has gone astray.*" This criticism, the Prophet conveyed because the preacher said: "*Whoever obeys Allah and His Messenger has gone straight, and whoever disobeys them has gone astray.*" (Naisaburi, t.t.: 2/870)

Therefore, the author disagrees if the Nahj al-Balaghah book is only studied on the issue of literary beauty and breadth of coverage, without being measured against the Qur'an and as-Sunnah. In-depth research is needed on the other side, for example on matters of creed, sharia, and others. So, this research tries to see how the concept of *sanad* in Nahj al-Balaghah and examines the content of the book in relation to the Islamic scientific tradition. It is intended that the readers of Nahj al-Balaghah not only focus on the style of language and literature used, but also can see more clearly the content and content of the book in accordance with the measure of the Qur'an and as-Sunnah.

Method

This research uses a qualitative method through literature review or literature and analyzes it descriptively. The main data used comes from the book *Nahj al-Balaghah* then we complete it with the book *Khashaish al-Aimmah* which is also the work of Syarif Radhi, it can even be said that the book *Khashaish al-Aimmah* is the first chapter for the book *Nahj al-Balaghah*. Therefore, these two books are an inseparable unity. While some other scholars' works as *syarah* (explanation) of Sharif Radhi's works, especially about the conception of science, as well as books, papers, articles, and research results related to the figure of Sharif Radhi and his book *Nahj al-Balaghah*, both pros and cons.

The approaches used in this research are historical and phenomenological approaches. Researchers collected data by referring to

facts in the form of history or past studies related to *Nahj al-Balaghah*. This is to review how history influenced the author of *Nahj al-Balaghah* to express his ideas in this book.

In analyzing the data, this research uses content analysis techniques and qualitative descriptive analysis. The content analysis technique is used to process data on the concept of science in the book *Nahj al-Balaghah*, so as to obtain conclusions from the various thoughts studied and their possible implications and consequences. Thus, it will be easy to draw a red thread of style and flow of thought of the author of *Nahj al-Balaghah*, especially in the matter of science.

There are several research steps. First, collecting the main source, namely the *Nahj al-Balaghah Book* then the *Khashaish al-Aimmah book*, which is related to the conception of science, books on the history of Syarif Radhi's life, and other complementary sources in the form of books of syarah (explanation) of Ibn Abi al-Hadid, translations and other related books. Second, classifying data based on the theory of the concept of science, and describing. Third, describing the concept of Ahlussunnah science based on the Qur'an and as-Sunnah represented by Imam Shafi'i and al-Hafidz bin Abd al-Barr as a measuring tool for the concept of *Nahj al-Balaghah* science. Fourth, criticizing the concept of *Nahj al-Balaghah* and connecting it with the subject matter. The criticism in question is the Hadith expert's criticism of the *sanad* and *matan*. Fifth, summarizing the results of the analysis so that the existing problems are answered.

Discussion

About Nahj al-Balaghah

Nahj al-Balaghah was written by Muhammad (Abu al-Hasan) bin al-Husain (Abi Ahmad ath-Thahir), a descendant of Imam Musa bin Imam Ja'far as-Sadiq who was given the title Sharif Radhi. He was born in 359 AH in Baghdad during the time of Caliph al-Muthi' al-Abbasi (334-363 AH), where Caliph al-Abbasi was only a symbol, while the ruling party was Banu Buwaih (Shia). Iraq was then ruled by Izz ad-Daulah Bakhtiyar bin Muiz ad-Daulah bin Abu Shuja' Buwaih.

Sharif Radhi inherited his father's greatness and position, and studied with many of the great scholars of his time until he became a leading Shia figure, a Mu'tazilah figure, as well as a supreme poet with his brother

Syarif Murtadha, Ali (Abu al-Qasim) bin Husain (Abu Ahmad ath-Thahir) (355-436 H).

The scholars agree that Sharif Radhi was an adherent of the Shia Imamiyyah faith as well as Mu'tazilah, who was *ghuluw* to the twelve Shia Imams, and hated and rejected Abu Bakr, Umar and Usman r.a. whom he considered to be usurpers and robbers of the right of khilafah. Imam ad-Dzahabi in al-Musytabih said: "Sharif Radhi was a mufliq (good poet) (Abduh, t.t: 16), of the Imamiyyah Shia faith" (Dimasyqi, 1993: 9/190). Finally on 6 Muharram 406 AH Sharif Radhi died in Baghdad at the age of 47 (Hadid, 1965: 40).

The position of Nahj al-Balaghah among the Shias

Nahj al-Balaghah occupies a high position in Shia circles. Some data that can explain this include:

1. *Nahj al-Balaghah* is believed to be a book of Hadith and all of its contents are authentic; to deny it is to deny the Prophet's Hadith. The al-Baqir Foundation of Bangil Pasuruan published a book entitled "*560 Hadiths from 14 Holy Men*", and made Nahj al-Balaghah its main reference (Guyen, 1995: 57-73). Al-Hadi Kashif al-Ghitha' al-Najafi (1289-1361 AH) said in Mustadrak Nahj al-Balaghah (Qifari, 1414: 1/389):
 In fact, the Shiites, even though there are many sects and differences, they all agree and accept that everything in the Nahj al-Balaghah comes from the words of Amirul Mukminin Ali r.a., because they believe in the history of Syarif Radhi and his understanding and tsiqahan, to the extent that almost Of course, according to them, the denial of his credit to R.A. including denying dharuriyyat and badihiyyat, the situation is the same as what was narrated from the Prophet. (Ghitha, t.t.: 90-91, Qifari, 1414: 1/472).
2. *Nahj al-Balaghah* contains the true Islam. A website affiliated to Grand Ayyatallah Mousawi Ardebili explains that the birth of the Nahj al-Balaghah was motivated by Sharif Radhi's desire to introduce the "true religion of Islam" to everyone in the world by introducing the true Shia (Dimiyati, t.t).
3. *Nahj al-Balaghah* is a divine book, the most important after the Qur'an, which must be read and is an important reference for Shiites. Muhammad al-Husain al-Kashif al-Ghitha called it *al- Sifr al-'Azhim la tsani lahu ba'da Kitab Allah* (The Great Book is second to none after the Quran) Zahra, 1405: 1/11). Leader of Iran's Shia Revolution Ayatollah Khumaini in Nahj al-Balaghah Congress) 27/2/1360 HS said that *Nahj*

al-Balaghah is the "Divine Book" (Qummi: t.t.). The leader of Iran's Shia revolution made a statement:

We are proud that the book *Nahj al-Balaghah* which he is the greatest author for material and immaterial life after the Koran, and the highest book for freeing humans, and its teachings which are values (norms) and laws government and is the most noble manhaj of life comes from our ma'shum imam. We are proud that the priests who ma'shum starting from Ali bin Abi Talib to the savior of mankind Imam Mahdi Sahib al-zaman (imam of this Age) - may Allah give thousands respect and greetings- which is by the power of Allah Almighty him live and pay attention to all affairs... (Khumaini, t.t; Anonymous (Embassy Iran in Jakarta), t.t.: 79).

4. *Nahj al-Balaghah* is above the speech of all creatures. Abu al-Qasim al-Khu'i, leader of the Iraqi Najaf Shiites, said: "Indeed, the best thing to say in explaining the nature of *Nahj al-Balaghah* is: he is below the words of the Almighty who created and above the words of the creatures." (Khu'i, n.d.).

Overview and Content of *Nahj al-Balaghah*

Nahj al-Balaghah contains a collection of sermons, letters, wirid, mau'izhah, adab, supplications and wisdom sayings attributed to 'Ali r.a. without any sanad. The selection criteria for these sayings of Caliph 'Ali were literary eloquence and *balaghah*. *Nahj al-Balaghah* is organized in three parts: Sermons (speeches), letters, and aphorisms (wisdom).

The *Nahj al-Balaghah* contains: 239 sermons, 79 letters and 478 wisdom sayings (Abduh, t.t). Some say 238 sermons, 79 letters and 489 words of wisdom. Or 238 sermons, 79 letters and 488 words of wisdom (Jabir, 1987). Others count: 241 Sermons, 79 surahs and 480 aphorisms. Sharif Radhi tried to select the most beautiful, fashih and baligh Alawi traditions. This is the secret of the *Nahj al-Balaghah*'s longevity and its fame.

The concept of *sanad* in *Nahj al-Balaghah*

After researchers conducted a study of the *Nahj al-Balaghah* book, it turned out that this glorified book did not have the concept of sanad and its narrations were also without *sanad*. Meanwhile, the distance between Sharif Radhi and Imam Ali is almost four centuries, and Sharif Radhi himself is a *ghuluw*

in glorifying the imam and antagonizing the companions. The narration of such a person is not accepted in the Rijal science of Ahl al-Sunnah. (Asqalani, 1326: 1/94).

In *Nahj al-Balaghah* there is a claim that satirizes Ahl al-Sunnah who narrate with a sanad and are considered not to understand the content. Consider the following attribute of Ahl al-Bayt, after Imam 'Ali describes Ahl al-Bayt as the reference in religion and ma'shum he says:

“They (the Ahl al-Bayt) understand this religion with an understanding that is not the understanding of hearing and narrating, because the narrators of science are many, while the preservers are few” (Abduh, t.t.: 283, no. 237).

This good saying has no evidence to be supported by the sanad as Imam Ali's saying, rather it is the saying of the Companion Abdullah bin Masud r.a.. For example, Abu Nuaim narrates with a muttashil sanad up to Ibn Mas'ud that he said: "Be for science a preserver and do not be only a narrator, because sometimes one preserves but does not narrate, and some narrate but do not preserve" (Nuaim, 1974: 7/262; Barr, 1994: 1/696, no. 1238; Anzi, 2010).

This proves that some of the contents of *Nahj al-Balaghah* are not from the sayings of Imam 'Ali but from the sayings of other people who are named after Imam 'Ali because of their beauty. *Nahj al-Balaghah* does not have a chain of transmission to Imam 'Ali (a.s.) and even the books of hadith to which it refers are absent or unmentioned; what is mentioned are books or treatises on language, literature and history or hikayat, and even then only in eleven places. These include *al-Bayan wat-Tabyin* by al-Jahizh al-Mu'tazili, *al-Maqamat* by Abu Ja'far al-Iskafi al-Mu'tazili, *al-Muqtadhab* by al-Mubarrid, *al-Maghazi* by Said bin Yahya al-Umawi, *al-Jamal* by al-Waqidi, *Tarikh Ibn Jarir ath-Thabari*, *Hikayat of Abi Ja'far Muhammad bin Ali al-Baqir*, narration of al-Yamani from Ahmad bin Qutaibah, a book in the handwriting of Hisham bin al-Kalbi, story of Dhirar bin Hamzah al-Dhiba'i/al-Shada'i, narration of Abu Juhaifah, *Hikayat of Tsa'lab* from Abu al-A'rabi

The book *Nahj al-Balaghah*, which has no sanad, explains that people who narrate traditions are divided into four: *hypocrites* (this is making false traditions, lying in the name of the Prophet), *mukhtthi* (narrating wrongly, different from what the Prophet said because he did not memorize), *shubhat* (hearing the Prophet commands something then not knowing that the Prophet afterwards forbade or the opposite. Had he known that what he memorized was *mansukh* he would have rejected it, so if the

it), and *shadiqun hafizhun* (truthful, pious, does not lie, does not make mistakes, memorizes what he narrates according to what he means, He memorizes the nasikh and applies it; he memorizes the mansukh and avoids it; he understands the khash and the 'am; he puts everything in its place; he understands the mutasyabih, which are cryptic sayings that only Allah and the rasikhun understand the meaning of; and its muhkam, which is a clear text that has not been abrogated.

Then afterwards Sharif Radhi concluded with the words, "*These are the forms that people have in their differences and their diseases in their history.*" If it is connected with the creed of Imamate and 'ishmah for Ahlul Bayt, then the Shiites are positioned as the fourth group, namely those who accommodate the science of Allah and His Messenger, without transmitting the narrators who according to them are many lies and mistakes.

Analysis Result

This concept of *Isnad* was first applied by Abu Bakr as-Siddiq (Jabbar, t.t.: 1/47; Suyuthi, t.t.: 1/257; Hisham, 1955: 1/399), and by the Companions (r.a.) then this concept of *Isnad* was applied among the Muslims when the ahl al bid'ah appeared in 35 AH, at the time of the killing of Caliph Uthman (r.a.) as narrated by Muhammad bin Sirin (d. 110 AH) in Sahih Muslim. This shows that when the tradition was circulating among the Companions only, they informed each other and there was no need to ask about the *isnad*, because all the Companions were just, which means righteous and trustworthy, based on the text from Allah, the Sunnah and Ijma' (Baghdadi, t.t.: 1/46; Shalah, 1986: 1/292).

Imam ash-Shafi'i illustrates the importance of this sanad by saying, "Whoever does not ask from where? Then he is like a seeker of firewood at night, carrying a bundle of firewood on his back, lest a snake peck at it" (Jurjani, 1997: 1/206). As an application, if a tradition is mentioned to Imam ash-Shafi'i that he does not recognize, he says: "Prove its validity (tsubutnya) until I follow it" (Mawardi, 1999: 10/19).

After that Imam ash-Shafi'i said, "All science (religion) other than the Quran is preoccupying, except hadith and jurisprudence in religion. That science is that which has haddatsana in it (there is a chain of transmission), other than that it is the waswas of the devil" (Shafi'I, 2010: 106; Subki, 1413: 1/297; Katsir, 2004). Al-Husayn ibn 'Ali al-Karabisi said, "Imam ash-Shafi'i said: All those

who speaks on the basis of the Qur'an and as-Sunnah is serious, otherwise it is *hadzayan* (joking)" (Katsir, 2004; Muthraji, t.t.: 1/14).

Thus, according to the view and manhaj of Imam ash-Shafi'i, the *Nahj al-Balaghah* is a mixture of firewood and snakes, containing demonic misgivings and jokes, except for the part that is proven to be true. So the book of *Nahj al-Balaghah* cannot be used as proof. Al-Hafizh Ibn Abdil Barr said: "The proof is in terms of the chain of transmission, it is strict in terms of rulings and in terms of halal and haram" (Barr, 1994: 1/152).

Teachings of Nahj al-Balaghah

Since *Nahj al-Balaghah* does not have a valid chain of transmission back to Sayyidina 'Ali, much of its content contradicts Islam, the Prophet, the Companions and Ahl al-Bayt. Here are some examples of the false claims of *Nahj al-Balaghah*:

1. Example of Shia Sanad

The most famous sermon is the *Shiqshiqiyah* (no. 3 in *Nahj al-Balaghah*), which rejects the Caliphs Abu Bakr, Umar, and Usman and accuses them of usurping the rights of Ali r.a. It says Imam Ali said:

"Remember, by Allah, the khilafah has been used by so-and-so (Abu Bakr), while he knows my position from him is like the position of the quthub from the mill, (which) the floodwaters descend away from me and the birds cannot ascend to me." (Abduh, t.t.: 33).

This sermon, with this wording is not true of the speech of Ali r.a. Ghuwaid bin Shabab bin Shaleh al-Ghamidi has criticized it, the gist of which is as follows:

a. In terms of sanad

- 1) Sharif Radhi did not mention the sanad and source, as usual.
- 2) Shia people, when asked for the sanad of *Nahj al-Balaghah* narrations, always refer to the book *Mashadir Nahj al-Balaghah Wa Asaniduhu* by Abd az-Zahra' al-Khathib, even though this book has been proven not to be a proof (Ghamidi, 2012: 222).
- 3) When referring to Abd az-Zahra', we find him mentioning 16 sources (Ghamidi, 2012: 223-224; Khatib, 1988: 1/309-312).

Seeing the number of sources cited, the reader

would get the impression that these are valid, but it turns out that they are all meaningless and unqualified, and many of the sources are people who lived after Sharif Radhi. Ghuwaid discusses one by one what Abd az-Zahra' mentions and refutes it, with much reference to Ala ad-Din al-Bashir the author of the book *Usthurah al-Khothbah ash-Syiqshiqiyyah* which refutes and proves the falsehood of the sermon of *Shiqshiqiyyah*, even giving an open challenge to Shiites around the world if they can bring a sanad (Ghamidi, 2012: 230-233).

b. In terms of matan

As for the text, it is impossible for this sermon to have come from Imam 'Ali because its content is kufr, namely establishing the Imamate of ma'shumah for himself and establishing treason and kufr for Caliphs Abu Bakr, 'Umar and 'Uthman. Ghuwaid refuted the text of this sermon to the extent of nine points (Ghamidi, 2012: 234-237).

2. Example of Sanad Mu'tazilah

Sermon number one in Nahj al-Balaghah contains one of the five Mu'tazilah *Ushuls*, in fact the most core one, namely Ta'thil ash-Shifat which comes to the conclusion "the Quran is a being". Among the contents of this sermon are:

"The beginning of this religion is to know Him, and the perfection of monotheism is to be sincere with Him, and the perfection of sincerity with Him is to deny His attributes, for the witness of every attribute is not that which bears the attribute, and the witness of every attribute is not that attribute." (Abduh, t.t.: 25).

Is this really the teaching of Imam Ali r.a? Is there any Sanad?

a. In terms of sanad

- 1) This sermon is long, wide and difficult, it is impossible for someone to imitate it with his pronunciation without having it written in front of him, but Sharif Radhi presented it with a sign of sanad and without a source.
- 2) Abd az-Zahra' al-Khathib mentioned that his sources are Ali bin Muhammad bin Syakir al-Wasithi in *'Uyun al-Mawa'izh wa al-Hikam*, az-Zamakhshari in *Rabi' al-Abrar*, al-Quthub ar-Rawandi in *Syarah Nahj al-Balaghah*, Ibn Shu'bah in *Tuhfah al-'Uqul*, Muhammad bin Talhah ash-Shafi'i in *Mathalib as-Sa'ul*, Ibn Manshur Ahmad bin Abi

Talib ath-Thabarsi in *al-Ihtijaj*, Muhammad bin Salamah known as Qadhi al-Qudhat in *Dustur Ma'alim al-Hikam*, and Tafsir ar-Razi to name a few (Ghamidi, 2012: 658).

- 3) Tafsir ar-Razi, *Dustur Ma'alim al-Hikam*, Mathalib *al-Sa`ul, al-Ihtijaj, Tuhfah al-'Uqul, Rawandi's Nahj al-Balaghah*, Zamakhshari's *Rabi' al-Abrar* are not suitable as correct sources for this sermon, for the reasons already explained.
- 4) The book of *'Uyun al-Mawa'izh wa al-Hikam* by 'Ali al-Wasithi (457 AH) is even worse, because: there is no mention of a sanad, it is very different from what is in *Nahj al-Balaghah*, there is very little, perhaps other talks that have nothing to do with *Nahj al-Balaghah*, the author is younger than Sharif Radhi.

'Abd az-Zahra"s claim that this sermon was memorized by the Imams, mentioned in their sayings, is utterly baseless.

b. In terms of matan

Ghuwaid ibn Shabab debunked this narration as follows:

- 1) In this sermon there are many difficult words, unfamiliar meanings and forced rhymes, not known in the time of the Companions let alone on the tongues of the Caliphs ar-Rashidun.
- 2) The sermon contains muwallad (newly-emerged) words or terms such as "*al-Juz, al-hadd, al-wujud*" and the like that did not exist except in the Abbasid era when the philosophy was translated.
- 3) Long sermon introduction, this was only known in the Abbasid period (during the time of Sharif Radhi) in the Friday or holiday sermons.
- 4) The sentence "the beginning of religion is to know it" This is a Mu'tazilah paper, that the first obligation of the mukallaf is nazhar for ma'rifat to the creator, not reciting the two sentences of shahada as Ahlussunnah.
- 5) The core of the sermon calls for *ta'thil*, rejecting the Attributes of Allah. This is Mu'tazilah taking from Jahmiyyah. Washil bin 'Atha' the pioneer of the Mu'tazilah denied the attributes of Allah because he thought that establishing the attributes meant establishing

the multiplicity of the *Qadim*, which meant shirk, therefore he said: "Whoever establishes the meaning of the former attributes has established the existence of two gods" (Shaharastani: 1/46).

This is what Imam Shafi'i meant when he said: "People do not become ignorant and disagree except because they abandon the Arabic language and gravitate towards the language of Aristotle" (Dzahabi: 8/268; Suyuthi: 15).

- 6) In this sermon in this Shia innovation off the imamate after the Prophet. This is clearly an infiltration to serve his sect.
- 7) When referring to the Mu'tazilah book, they mention that I'tizal existed before Washil Bin Atha', even this I'tizal comes from the teachings of Ali bin Abi Talib, even his son Muhammad bin al-Hanafiyyah took this madhhab from his father then passed on to his son Abu Hashim his teacher Washil. So Ibn al-Murtadha az-Zaidi attributed Imam Ali to *I'tizal*. (Segaf, tt).

This further indicates that these sects have always rejected existing (valid) narrations, and created false ones to serve their sects. This is because the claim of Imam 'Ali being a Mu'tazilah is only found in the Mu'tazilah book, and its sanad is not authentic, meaning it is of their making.

A Khawarij leader after his repentance warned about the importance of sanad and acknowledged that the innovators had fabricated traditions: "These traditions are religion so see from where you take your religion. Indeed we used to when we liked something we would make it a tradition" (Baghdadi: 1/123, 128).

This is the Shia Rafidhah, they reject facts that exist, and something that does not exist they make up. The figure of Ibn Saba' al-Jew who initiated the bid'ah *al-washiyyah* for Imam Ali and the *bara'ah* of the companions existed but they tried to reject it. In the book *Ibn Saba' al-Syabah al-Mukhif* it is explained that there were two figures of Abdullah ibn Saba', one was burned by Imam Ali and one was expelled to Madain (Bashir, 1429: 470-471). They rejected the musnadah hadiths, the consensus on Abu Bakr's allegiance, and the Usmani Mushaf. Those that do not exist are fabricated, such as Imam Ali's sermon blaspheming Abu Bakr, Umar, Usman, Aisha, Talhah, Zubayr and the Companions, the existence of the Shia Mahdi, and the mazlumiyyat Fatimah (injustices inflicted on Fatimah).

The jurisprudence of the Ja'fari madhhab also did not exist, he did not have a book of jurisprudence like the Imams of the four madhhabs. So Shaykh Thaha al-Dulaimi wrote the book *Usthurah al-Madzhab al-Ja'fari* in defense of this Imam Ja'far. Ibn Abd al-Barr said: "Imam Shadiq is known to be tsiqah and trustworthy, intelligent, wise, valiant, excellent, to him the Ja'fariyyah are attributed, the Imamiyyah Shi'a claim it. The Shias tell many lies in his name." (Barr, 1387: 2/66).

Because it has no chain of transmission and no source, yet it has claimed and declared itself to be the only legitimate and correct one, there is the irregularity that Shias who came after the time of Sharif Radhi tried to trace the traditions of *Nahj al-Balaghah* from their sources, and it has been announced that all the contents of *Nahj al-Balaghah* are correct, it turns out that many traditions whose sources are actually younger than *Nahj al-Balaghah*, and even then many of them do not connect with those in *Nahj al-Balaghah*. Imam al-Auza'i is right: "Knowledge is not lost except with the loss of sanad" (Barr, 1387: 1/57). Thus, knowledge is lost from the hands of the Shias because they have lost the chain of transmission to the Messenger of Allah (S) and his Companions.

Based on the above facts, *Nahj al-Balaghah* is not a source of knowledge in the fields of religion, creed, hadith, the history of the Companions, and the morals of the righteous salaf; rather it is a science of language, literature, and the natural and social sciences that must be weighed against the Qur'an and as-Sunnah.

3. An example of the teaching of *bara'ah* (disassociation) from the Prophet's Wives and Companions because it was claimed that they were hostile to Ali.

Nahj al-Balaghah on behalf of Imam 'Ali inculcates the attitude of *bara'ah* towards the companions of the Prophet. It is said that Imam 'Ali said, "I have been oppressed ever since the Prophet died." (Abduh, t.t.: 99). "By God, I have been constantly deprived of my right, deprived of my right, since God took the life of his Prophet (peace be upon him) until the time of man today" (Radhi, 1406: 39).

From this, the companions and the Muslim community of the time of the caliphs ar-Rashidun and especially the time of Muawiyah are described by *Nahj al-Balaghah* as: *mariqun* (out of religion), *nakibun* (deviant), *nakitsun* (apostate), *khainun* (traitor), *murtabun* (indecisive person), *munafiqun* (hiding kufr), *dhallun* (misguided), *maftunun* (slandered), *mufariqun* (separated) (Muhammadi, 2009: 3-4).

In the book of *kisah-kisah Nahj al-Balaghah*, on the cover of which is written "Decree of the Director General of Islamic Education number Dj.1/375/2009." it is said: Muawiyah, who was among the *qasithun* (the disobedient), expanded his territory by repression and terror and massacre, ruthless and cruel (Muhammadi, 2009: 4, 18, 20, 28-29). Muawiyah was the founder of the heresy of cursing Imam Ali (Muhammadi, 2009: 56-57). Amr bin Ash sold religion to Muawiyah (Muhammadi, 2009: 22). Talhah and Zubayr were *nakitsun* (Muhammadi, 2009: 4), plotting against Imam 'Ali (Muhammadi, 2009: 11). Talhah was an unjust instigator (Muhammadi, 2009: 31). The prophet's friend Asya'ats ibn Qais al-Kindi was the leader of the hypocrites at the time of Imam Ali (Muhammadi, 2009: 15, 37). Nu'man ibn Bashir r.a. was a sycophant and supporter of the unjust ruler Muawiyah (Muhammadi, 2009: 34).

In the book of *Mutiara Sastra Nahj al-Balaghah Edisi Surat dan Aforisme* published by al-Huda, ICC (Islamic Cultural Center) Jakarta, it is written that Muawiyah was a rebel to seize power (Muhammadi, 2009: 63-65), a servant of falsehood, his whole life oppressed the truth, a disaster maker, a hypocrite (Muhammadi, 2009: 71), converted to Islam ostensibly out of necessity (Muhammadi, 2009: 92), Muawiyah was a devil who approached believers from the front and back, from the right and left (Muhammadi, 2009: 133), Aisha was an open enemy and rebel (Muhammadi, 2009: 29). This companion of the Prophet was condemned to apostasy for appointing Abu Bakr as Caliph, betraying the Prophet and his Ahl bait (Muhammadi, 2009: 147).

With this fact, it is evident that Sharif Radhi was an extreme Rafidhah Imamiyyah Shiite, not a moderate as mentioned by Muhammad Rashid Ridha Al-Husaini (1947: 1/10). Imam Shafi'i said, "Whoever says Abu Bakr and Umar are not Imams is a Rafidhah (extreme Shia)" (Dzahabi, 2006: 10/31; Harawi, 1998: 4/308).

These unsubstantiated claims of Nahj al-Balaghah attributed to Caliph 'Ali contradict the Qur'an, the authentic Hadiths and the historical fact that Imam 'Ali and the Ahlul Bayt pledged allegiance to the caliphs ar-Rashidin, became their ministers and advisors, entered into treaty relations with them and named their sons after Abu Bakr, 'Umar, 'Usman and 'Aishah.

Conclusion

The *Nahj al-Balaghah* has no sanad. All the alawi traditions in the *Nahj al-Balaghah* (239 sermons, 79 suras, and 478 pearls of wisdom, or 238 sermons, 79 suras, and 489 pearls of wisdom, or 238 sermons, 79 suras, and 488 pearls of wisdom. Or 241 sermons, 79 suras and 480 aphorisms) were transmitted by Sharif Radhi (359-306 AH) a Rafidhah and Mu'tazilah leader from Imam Ali without a sanad, while the distance between him and Imam Ali was almost 4 centuries. *Nahj al-Balaghah* itself does not contain the concept of sanad, and is not built on sanad, so there are beautiful sayings claimed as Imam Ali's sayings when based on muttashil sanad, similar sayings come from Ibn Mas'ud.

Nahj al-Balaghah contains the creed of *Tasyayyu'* Ghali (Shia Rafidhah) which is the cult of Imam Ali and the next 11 Imams, and contains the creed of bara'ah (disassociation) from Caliphs Abu Bakr, Umar and Usman, and hostility to the companions of the Prophet Muhammad. *Nahj al-Balaghah* portrays Caliphs Abu Bakr, Umar and Usman, Aisha the Prophet's wife, Abu Hurairah, Talhah, Zubair and Muawiyah as bad companions of the Prophet, traitors and apostates. In addition, *Nahj al-Balaghah* also contains the Mu'tazilah creed.

Recommendation

The *Nahj al-Balaghah*, which is famous as a book of literature that bewitched many people because of the beauty of its language and the breadth of its themes, and because it was attributed to Imam 'Ali ibn Abi Talib, turned out to contain ghuluw to some of the Ahl al-Bayt and serious hatred of the *khulafa ar-Rashidin* before 'Ali, to the Ummahatul Mukminin and to other companions of the Prophet. It was all attributed to Imam 'Ali without a sanad. Given the importance of the findings of this study, the researcher recommends that: First, Muslims should be warned of their mistake and keep *Nahj al-Balaghah* as a book of literature and not a book of hadith. Secondly, this scientific *tabayyun* activity should be encouraged so that it becomes common and cultured as a characteristic of Ahlussunnah wa al-Jamaah. Imam Shafi'I said: If you see someone who can walk on water and fly in the air then do not be fooled by him until you weigh him against the Qur'an and as-Sunnah."

Referencea

- Anonim, t.t. *Sekilas Tentang Imam Khomeini*. tanpa penerbit. (Jakarta: Kedubes Iran).
- Anshari, Zakariya al-Anshari. t.t. *Fath al-Baqi 'Ala Alfiyah al-'Iraqi*. Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah.
- Asqalani, Ahmad ibn Ali Ibn Hajar al-. t.t. *Nuzhah al-Nazhar*. Mesir: Mushthafa al-Babi al-Halabi wa Awladuhu.
- _____, 1326, *Tahdzib al-Tahdzib*. India: Mathbaah Dairah al-Ma'arif al-Nizhamiyyah.
- Abduh, Muhammad. t.t. *Syarah Nahj al-Balaghah*. tahqiq Muhammad Ahmad Asyur, Dar Mathabi' al-Sya'b.
- Anzi, Abu Abdillah ibn Jafil al-. 2010. *Ma huwa Takhrij Atsar Kunu li al-'ilmi ru'at*. <http://www.aahlalhddeeth.com/vb/showthread.php?t=249510>, (1 Agustus 2016).
- Baghdadi, Abu Bakar al-Khatib al-. t.t. *Al-Kifayah fi 'Ilm al-Riwayah*. tahqiq al-Suraqi dan al-Madani, Madinah: Maktabah al-Ilmiyya.
- Barr, Abu Umar Yusuf ibn Abd al-. 1994. *Jami' Bayan al-'Ilmi wa Fadhlih*, Tahqiq Abu Al-Asybal, Saudi Arabia: Dar Ibn al-Jauzi.
- _____, 1387. *al-Tamhid Lima fi al-Muwaththa` Min al-Ma'ani wa al-Masanid*. Maghrib: Wizarah al-Auqaf wa al-Syu`un al-Islamiyyah.
- Bashir, Ala` al-Din al-. 1429. *Ibn Saba` al-Syabah al-Mukhif*, al-Thiba'ah al-'Ashriyyah.
- Bashori, Agus Hasan, 2016, *Studi Kritis Konsep Ilmu Dalam Kitab Nahj al-Balaghah dan Relevansinya dalam Penguatan Pendidikan Agama Islam di Tingkat Sekolah Dasar*, Disertasi Program Doktor Pendidikan Islam UIKA Bogor.
- Bukhari, Muhammad ibn Ismail al-. 1422. *Al-Jami' al-Musnad al-Shahih*, Ta'liq: Mushthafa Dib al-Bugha. Dar Thauq al-Najah.
- Dimasyqi, Muhammad al-Qaisi al-. 1993. *Taudhih al-Musytabih fi Dhabt Asma` al-Ruwah*. Beirut: Muassasah al-Risalah.
- Dzahabi, Syamsuddin Al-. 2006. *Siyar A'lam al-Nubala'*, Kairo: Darul hadits.

- Dimiyati, Nashir. t.t. *Syarif Radhi*, <http://www.sadeqin.net/ml/daneshvaran.php?mod=4&id=16> (2 September 2015).
- Fayyadh, Ahmad Ayyub Muhammad Abdullah al-. 2007. *Mabahits Fi al-Hadits al-Musalsal*, Beirut: al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah.
- Ghamidi, Ghuwaid ibn Syabab al-. 2012. *Kitab Nahj al-Balaghah Dirasah Naqdiyyah 'Aqdiyyah*, Makkah: Ummul Qura.
- Guyen, Fatih. 1995. *560 Hadis dari 14 manusia Suci*. Bangil: Yayasan Islam al-Baqir.
- Ghitha, Al-Hadi Kasyif al-. t.t., *Mustadrak Nahj al-Balaghah*, tanpa penerbit (Maktabah Ahl al-Bayt)
- Hadid, Ibn Abi al-, 1997. *Syarah Nahj al-Balaghah*, Dar Ihya' al-Turats al-'Arabi, Tahqiq: Muhammad Abu al-Fadhl Ibrahim.
- Harawi, Abu Ismail al-, 1998, *Dzamm al-Kalaf wa Ahlih*, Madinah Munawwarah: Maktabah al-Ulum wa al-Hikam.
- Hindi, Rahmatullah al-, t.t. *Izhhar al-Haq*, tahqiq: Muhammad Ahmad Malkawi, al-Riasah 'ammah li Idarat al-Buhuts, Saudi.
- Hisyam, Abdul Malik ibn. 1955. *al-Sirah al-Nabawiyah*, tahqiq: Mushthafa Saqa dkk, Mesir: Syarikah Mushthafa al-babi al-Halabi.
- Jabir, Qasim Habib. 1987. *Al-Falsafah wa al-I'tizal Fi Nahj al-Balaghah*. al-Muassasat al-Jami'iyah li al-Dirasat wa al-Nasyr.
- Jabbar, Al-Qadhi Abdul. t.t. *Tatsbit Dalail al-Nubuwwah*, Kairo: Dar al-Mushthafa, Syabra.
- Jurjani, Abu Ahmad ibn Adi al-. 1997. *Al-Kamil fi Dhu'afa' al-Rijal*, tahqiq: Adil Ahmad Abdul Maujud dkk, Beirut: al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah.
- Jama'ah, Badruddin Muhammad ibn. t.t., *al-Manhal al-Rawiy Fi Mukhtashar Ulum al-Hadits*, Beirut: Dar al-Fikr
- Khatib, Abd az-Zahra' al-. 1988. *Mashadir Nahj al-Balaghah wa Asaniduh*, Beirut: Dar az-Zahra'.

- Khumaini, Al-Imam al-. t.t. *Al-Washiyyah al-Ilahiyyah al-Siyasiyyah*, <http://www.imam-khomeini.com/web1/arabic/showitem.aspx?cid=2004&h=19&f=20&pid=2337> (2 Desember 2014).
- _____, t.t. *Al-Washiyyah al-Ilahiyyah al-Siyasiyyah*, <http://arabic.irib.ir/Monasebat/E-khomeini/vasiyat2.htm> (1 September 2016).
- _____, *Wasyiyyat al-Imam al-Khumaini*, http://www.eslam.de/arab/manuskript_arab/testament/testament_imam_chomeini.htm (26 Desember 2016).
- Khu'i, Sayyid al-. tt. *I'jaz al-Quran*, <http://www.alkhoei.net/ar/Opinion/5/3-نارؤلا زاجعإ-ميركلا>, dan <http://al-khoei.us/edara/index.php?id=32> (21 Oktober 2015).
- Katsir, Abu al-Fida' Ibn. 2004. *Thabaqat asy-Syafi'iyin*, Dar al-Wafa', al-Manshurah.
- Mawardi, Abu al-Hasan Ali al-. 1999. *al-Hawi al-Kabir*, tahqiq: Ali Muhammad Mu'awwidh dan Adil Ahmad, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah.
- Muthraji, Mahmud. t.t. *Sirah Imam Muhammad ibn Idris asy-Syafi'i dalam kitab al-Umm*, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah.
- Manzhur, Jamaluddin Abu al-Fadhl Muhammad ibn. t.t. *Lisan al-Arab*, materi sanad, Dar al-Ma'arif.
- Muhammadi, Muhammad. 2009. *Kisah-Kisah Nahj al-Balaghah*. Jakarta: PT. Trisula Adisakti.
- Naisaburi, Muslim ibn Hajjaj al-. t.t. *al-Musnad al-Shahih*, tahqiq: Muhammad Fuad Abdul Baqi, Beirut: Dar Ihya' al-Turats al-'Arabi
- Nasir, Malki Ahmad. 2012. *Konsep ilmu dan Aplikasinya dalam Pembangunan (1)*. <http://insistnet.com./konsep-mu-dan-aplikasinya-dalam-pembangunan-1/> (19 Agustus 2015).
- Nu'aim, Abu. 1974. *Hilyah al-Auliya wa Thabaqah al-Ashfiya'*, Mesir: al-Sa'adah.
- Qari, Ali al-. t.t. *Syarh 'Ali al-Qari 'Ala Syarh Nukhbah al-Fikr*. Beirut: Dar al-Arqam.
- Qifari, Nashir al-. 1414. *Ushul Madzhab al-Syiah al-Imamiyyah al-Itsna Asyariyyah*. Jizah Saudi Arabia: Dar al-Ridha.

- Qummi, Shadiq Hasan Zadeh al-. t.t. *Pesan Imam Khumaini*, <http://balaghah.net/old/nahj-htm/id/id/01/10.htm> (9 September 2015).
- Radhi, al-Syarif al-. 1406. *Khashaish al-Aimmah*, Masyhad Iran, Majma' al-Buhuts al-Islamiyyah.
- Rifa'i, Shalih al-. t.t. *'Inayah al-Ulama' bi al-Isnad wa 'Ilm al-Jarh wa al-Ta'dil wa Atsaru Dzalika fi Hifzh as-Sunnah al-Nabawiyyah*, Madinah KSA: Majma al-Malik Fahd Lithibaah al-Mushhaf.
- Sijistani, Abu Daud Sulaiman al-, t.t. *Sunan Abi Daud*, tahqiq: Muhammad Muhyiddin Abdul Hamid, Beirut: al-Maktabah al-'Ashriyyah.
- Segaf, Alawi ibn Abd al-Qadir al. t.t. <http://www.dorar.net/enc/firq/711>, diakses, Kamis 1 September 2016.
- Suyuthi, Jalaluddin al-, t.t. *al-Khashaish al-Kubra*, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah.
- _____, t.t. *Shaun al-Manthiq wa al-Kalam 'an 'ilm al-Manthiq wa al-Kalam*.
- Shalah, Usman ibn Abdirrahman ibn al-. 1986. *Ma'rifah Anwa' 'Ulum al-Hadits (Muqaddimah Ibn al-Shalah)*, tahqiq: Nuruddin 'itr, Beirut: Dar al-Fikr.
- Subki, Tajuddin ibn Taqiyyuddin al-. 1413. *Thabaqat al-Syafi'iyah al-Kubra*, tahqiq: Mahmud Muhammad al-Thanahi dan Abdul Fattah Muhammad al-Huluw, Hajar.
- Syafi'i, Muhammad Ibn Idris, 2010, *Diwan al-Imam Al-Syafi'i*, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah.
- Syahrastani, Abu al-Fath Al- (548 H). *al-Milal wa al-Nihal*, Muassasah al-Halabi.
- Taimiyyah, Syaikh al-Islam Ibn. 1999. *al-Jawab al-Shahih Liman Baddala Dinal Masih*, tahqiq: Ali ibn Hasan dkk, Saudi: Dar al-'Ashimah.
- Turmudzi, Abu Isa Muhammad al-, 1975, *Sunan Turmudzi*, Mesir, Maktabah Mushthafa al-Babi al-Halabi.
- Zahra, Abd al-, 1405. *Mashadir Nahj al-Balaghah wa Asaniduhu*, Beirut: Dar al-Adhwa`.
- Zamakhsyari, Abu al-Qasim Mahmud al-. t.t. *Asas al-Lughah*, Kairo: Dar Mathabi' al-Sya'b.

