

## Error Analysis of Students' Recount Text Writing – Junior High School Student

Wahyu Indah Mala Rohmana<sup>1</sup> Puput Jianggimahastu L.S.<sup>2</sup>

UIN Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang<sup>1</sup>, Universitas PGRI Madiun<sup>2</sup>

e-mail: \*<sup>1</sup>[malaindah@uin-malang.ac.id](mailto:malaindah@uin-malang.ac.id), <sup>2</sup>[jianggimahastu@gmail.com](mailto:jianggimahastu@gmail.com).

---

Keywords:

*Error Analysis, Error Writing, Semantic, Writing Skill*

A B S T R A C T

Students have some difficulties in learning English as foreign language. The problems in four skills often appear especially in writing skill. Writing has some aspects that must be structured according to the system of rules in conducting coherent arrangement of word, clauses, and sentences. Some teachers use guided writing method in developing students' writing ability which makes student imitate and manipulate the model provided by teacher. The research analyzes semantic error in students' writing. Most of students in Junior high school have difficulties in producing well-formed sentences. The research is Class Evaluation Research using purposive sampling technique that the sample is taken from 5 students' text of third grade Junior High School Student in SMPN 1 Maospati. The objective of the study is to examine kinds of error commonly found in students' text writing. The analysis revealed that Junior High School students' writing difficulties are commonly in the grammatical prerequisites, lexical semantic property and often interlanguage interference in translation from the first language structure. The numerous errors also include the innapropriate use of the word and grammar in certain context or the form of the sentences. Based on the findings, suggestion for the teachers and students are given. The study concludes that the teacher should teach lexical semantic sense relation, focusing on the correct usage of the verbs and also emphasizing on the grammatical sense

---

### 1. INTRODUCTION

A language is a system of symbols through which people communicate. The symbols may be spoken, written, or signed with the hands. (Kreidler, 2002 : 19 ). It means that the communication of people can be achieved in some ways. One of them is writing. According to Era Susanti in Bambang Yudi Cahyono (2009:43), "Writing is an activity that combines words to form meaningful messages that the writer wants to express." It means that writing is an activity that combines words into meaningful sentence based on the writer's idea. Writing focuses on the process of developing its skill. Hogue (2003) stated that writing is not simply arranging sentences into paragraphs and setting each paragraph one after another but it involves organization of thought, sound usage of English language and imagination. In other word, writing involves many aspect in order to make the message of writing is understood by the reader. In order to make the text understandable, things like grammar, the choice of the word and the cohesion of the sentence must be thought carefully.

The importance of writing is very needed for students who learn English as a foreign language. It is because writing is a productive skill that is used not only for talking something (in written form) but also to be read by others. In other words, writing is a way for expressing meaning and creating the idea into real form. For this reason, it is important to the students for passing writing subject. Many students in this case are Junior High School students still have writing problems. They are vocabularies and the right time to use it in certain context. They also have a grammatical problem. The inappropriate choice of the words and relation may lead the reader to misunderstood the message of the writer. It can also increase the burden of interpreting the text.

The prescriptiveness of grammar has presented a problem for educators. Although it can be learned, many still have difficulties. Grammar itself is a productive potentiality. It means that it has certain role in helping make the processes of writing conscious for students. Brown (1980) states that human learning is fundamentally a process that involves the making of mistakes. Making error is a package of learning 3 processes (Thornbury, 1999). In this case, students usually make errors in the form of grammar. Some of them are like the inappropriate use of verb, determiner, tenses, preposition etc. These errors are more apparent in written language than those in spoken language. A study of McKeating (1981) declared that written errors were more obvious and people were more aware of errors in written work. Students might succeed learning tenses through grammar text books but failed to apply them when it came to put in a composition. Therefore, students need to be more aware in composing written work.

Writing is a skill that always has a relation with the aspect of linguistic. In conducting writing there are so many aspects that always have a role in content of a text. One of them are the role of lexical semantic or the word choice that is used by the student. Student maybe still overgeneralize the use of a word. The word we use is depend on the context in order to create the cohesion. Halliday (285) states, "There is cohesion between any pair of lexical items that stand to each other in some recognizable lexicosemantic (word meaning) relation". It means that part of lexical item that very influence each other is very important part of writing. He also states that this lexical item include synonym, near-synonym, superordinates, and also pairs of opposites of various kinds such as complementary and antonym. Collocation is a word or phrase that is frequently used together with another word or phrase and sounds natural and correct for native speakers. Inappropriate collocation may not be absolutely wrong, but rather infelicitous.

Some students probably still have some confusion in making sentence. They often influenced by interlanguage interference of mother language. Corder in Richard (1973:19) states, "People now believed they had a principled means for accounting for these error, namely that they were the result of interference on the learning of a second language from the habits of the first language". It can be said that some error that is raised in students writing often as it language interference from the mother language. It brings the system, word order or structure that still following the system of mother language. Selinker in Richard (1973:29) also argues that interlanguage is suggested to the intermediate stages between the mother language and target language that is observable in learners' language. He refers to language transfer, transfer of training, strategies of learning, strategies of communication and overgeneralization of target language linguistic material. In this research there are some errors that made by student in aspect of interlanguage interference in writing text.

Choosing the words and structure in texts in semantically and syntactically appropriate has been a big problem for students. The purpose of this paper is to seek the problem of grammatical, lexical properties, and language interference in the student's writing. It also shows how interlanguage interference in translation from the first language structure influences them in producing words. In the relation of semantic, writing is not only about exchanging words or sentences but also making meaning and making sense to other people.

## 2. METHOD

Researcher uses qualitative research in this research. Researcher uses qualitative research because the data that is collected by researcher is in the form of word, not the number. The data for this research consisted of recount text of 5 students of Third Grade Junior High School students, selected by using purposive sampling technique. The da

This research is Class Evaluation Research. Researcher uses evaluation research because of this research is conducted to evaluate student writing in order to analyze some error made by students. The data were chosen based on the data that revealed some adequate problem of the research. The subjects were chosen because of their achievement in writing process that is conducted by teacher during second semester of the year. Their ages range between 15-16 years. The subjects were instructed to make a recount text by following instruction: Tell about a story that you have been experienced in a text consist of 3-4 paragraphs individually. The subject were asked to make a text directly and given time 60 minutes in their classroom under the supervision of their teacher and researcher.

The content of this text is the type of text that the student has been learnt. This text should tell about their own experience that is composed in a structured recount text based on the generic structure and some language features of recount text.

## 3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The text made by the students is analyzed by the aim of identifying the semantic deviants in them. For establishing the deviants, researcher uses the basis by simple contrast with Standart English of educated speaker. There are 3 categories in this analysis that is analyzed by researcher for the deviants on the basis of the linguistic factor. They are Grammatical Prerequisites, Lexical Semantic Property, and Interlanguage Interference. They are Grammatical Prerequisites, Lexical Semantic Property, and Interlanguage Interference. These are further subdivided into three semantic deviants. Below is the diagram representing the categories.

Table 1. Coding of Problem

### LEXICO-SEMANTIC RELATION PROBLEM

Grammatical Prerequisites	Error of Grammatical Prerequisites	EGP
Lexical Semantic Property (Word Choice/Collocation)	Error of Word Choice	EWC
Interlanguage Interference	Error of Interlanguage Interference	EII

In composing text, students often encounter contexts in which time frames need to change frequently. Tenses take an important role in deciding which time forms proper to use in the

sentences. Written works require cohesion that, among many other important considerations, includes appropriate uses of tenses (Halliday & Hasan, 1976).

### 3.1 Grammatical Error

#### (a) Past Tenses

Among all the grammatical error, error in verb tenses are the most common found in students writing. It was clearly seen from the students' compositions that they are not consistent in the use of verb tenses. The teacher had already told them to write past experience, so they should have known to use past tense. The fact that the compositions are told in the past form of the verbs, means that they are not cautious of the correct verb tenses to be used. They are not aware that verbs also indicate time of occurrence. For example:

EGP 5 : After satisfied playing water, then I took a bath and change cloth.

EGP 10 : Sometime play a cook of banana and make cakes forms and kinds of cakes succeed created

EGP 29: He said I have to save my money than bringing my motorcycle to the washing service.

The extracts above show the improper use of tenses. The EGP 5 shows that the student did not have a consistency in using tense. The rule is when one uses present tense, all verbs in one sentence should also use the same tense. The sentence should be in the past tense but it is mixed in present tense. The correct verb "change" should have been "changed". The EGP 10 has the same problem. The verb "play" should be "played", "make" should be "made". In EGP 29 the verb "have to" should be in "had to"

#### (b) Sentence structure

The data reveal that the writer has a confusion in arrange the good sentence structure. The pattern of simple sentence usually is subject and then verb. In writing the text, the students often ignore those rules. They write according to what they want. For example:

EGP 24

I think it was small light object and easy to ride it.

EGP 23

Other times the drink in front of the mother.

EGP 17

Cut my hand when i cry and then hide in the wardrobe, sensitive mother soon realized, led me out of the cupboard and bandaged the wound with a bandage.

In the EGP 24 The phrases structure small light object is arranged in the wrong form. It should be light small object. Beside that there is an overlapping of subject. There are two same subjects which are not effectively used. The word it in the last sentence should be omitted because there is already "it" before. In EGP 23. There is no verb there, so it does not mean anything.

#### (c) Pronoun

Beside the error in tenses and verb, the other error which want to be discussed is error in using pronoun. For example :

EGP 27 : I imagined my father would be angry and never let my ride again.

According to Knaap and Watkins (2005 : 61) Pronouns provide a text with cohesion. Pronouns only work if they are not ambiguous. One kind of pronoun is possession. The usage of word “my” is not suitable or incorrect. It should be “me” not “my”. “My” refers to possessive determiner. It is changed into the correct pronoun “me” which is as an object in the sentences. The correct form should be “I imagined my father would be angry and never let me ride again.

### 3.2 Lexical Semantic property (Word Choice/ Collocation)

Word meaning normally involves concept and their relations in a lexical field. For example word bus and word taxi belong to the lexical field of transportation. In semantic error there are some confusion clasified by Hemchua & Schmitt (2006) in using superonym for hyponym, hyponym for a superonym, innapropriate co-hyponym, and using wrong near synonym. Hemchua & Schmitt (2006) also states, “Collocation is a word or phrase that is frequently used together with another word or phrase and sounds natural and correct for native speakers. Inappropriate collocation may not be absolutely wrong, but rather infelicitous”. It means that the writer often conduct their foreign language writing by still has a confussion in the system of word/phrase and also sound natural by their first language. In this research, researcher just analyzes some data in general semantic error in lexical item following the clasification that is categorized.

EWC 2 : After climbing ladder that made me tired enough, finally we reached the high part of Borobudur.

EWC 7 : On the way, we transitted on a jogja gift centre.

EWC 23 : There were so many people who sold all kinds of specialities Malang city

In the first sentence in EWC 2, there is an error in using near synonym for the word ladder. Based on the Oxford English Dictionary the word ladder has the meaning “a piece of equipment that is used for climbing up or down something” In this context the word ladder is refer to Borobudur temple so the word ladder is not suitable with the context. The suitable word for this context is “stairs”. In the second and third sentence in EWC 7 & EWC 23, there is an error in using superonym for a hyponym in the word gift & specialities. The word gift and specialities is classified as a general word where the spesific one is needed in this sentence. The context of this sentence related to something that can be bought in Jogjakarta or Malang. So, the suitable word to change in those sentence is souvenir.

EWC 3 : Borobudur temple has exciting beautifulness

In this sentence, there is an innapropriate collocation that is used. Innapropriate collocation may not be wrong at all, but it would be rather infelicitous. In this sentence the word beautifulnes actually is a wrong word. Maybe the subject means to use word beauty. But, the word beauty is also rather infelicitous in this context. So, it would be better to change it by word view or scenery that is represent Borobudur temple.

### 3.3 Interlanguage Interference

Some students often transfer (interference) from mother language to foreign language in writing a sentence. Richard (1970) states that interlanguage interference refers to the item that is produced by the student which reflect generalizations of the mother language based on partial exposure to the target language. Weinreich (1953:7) also states that interlanguage interference often happen to any speaker of two language. They will tend to identify sounds, words, structures and meaning in one language . In analyzing the data researcher find some interlanguage interference made by students in writing recount text.

EII 3 : Not to forget, we also took some photos in there to memorize it

EII 5 : In there many prehistory things we stored.

In this sentence, the student still bring the word order and structure from the first language. In EII 3 the word Not to forget is not accepted in English word pattern based on the role of this word order. In this sentence the student means that they had a time to take some photos at that place. The overgeneralization of the structure brought from the first language is often done by student in this case. Then, the word in there also has a confusion made by the student. As we know that the word in is unnecessary use in context to represent the meaning of the word there.

EII 10: There was also one played kite flying and rode ATV transportation

In this part, in a sentence EII 10, the student also doing the transfer of first language to target language. In the words kite flying and ATV transportation is still influenced by system of Bahasa Indonesia. The sentence is meant to tell that there is some kite flew by someone and also there were some people ride ATV. In this case, interlanguage interference still influenced the students in writing in foreign language. They prefer to transfer it directly without knowing the meaning cohesion inside it.

## 4. CONCLUSION

The findings in this paper show that the students have problem with semantic properties. Those are grammatical prerequisites, lexical properties, and language interference. Below is the result and the total of the students error.

Table 2 : Frequency of Errors

No	Error Types	Number of Errors
1	Grammatical	31
2	Lexical Properties	24
3	Interlanguage Interference	28

The table shows that there are 31 grammatical error, 24 lexical properties/ word choice, and 28 interlanguage interferences. Because of those error and problems they failed to construct text with the rule restriction of writing.

The implication of this is the students will still difficult to produce text as long as their knowledge of the grammatical, the word choice and language interference is lacked. To solve this problem, a good understanding of semantic relation can help them improving their writing ability. Beside that teacher should emphasize their teaching from the students writing difficulties which have been observed. The study concludes that the teacher should teach lexical semantic sense relation, focusing on the correct usage of the verbs and also emphasizing on the grammatical sense.

## REFERENCES

- [1] Bambang Yudi Cahyono. (2009). *Techniques in Teaching EFL Writing*. Malang: State Universitas of Malang Press.
- [2] Brown, H. D. (1980). *Principle in Language Learning an Teaching*. New Jersey: Pretice-Hall, Inc.
- [3] Halliday, M. A. K., & Hasan, R. (1976). *Cohesion in English*. London: Longman.
- [4] Hemchua, Saengchan and Norbert Schmitt. (2006). An Analysis of Lexical Error in the English compositions of Thai Learner. *Prospect Vol.21, No 3*
- [5] Hogue, A. (2003). *The Essential of English: A Writer's Handbook*. New York: Pearson Education.
- [6] Knaap, Peter & Watkins, Megan. (2005). *Genre, Text, Grammar : Technologies for Teaching and Assessing Writing*. Australia :University of New South Wales Press.
- [7] Kreidler, Charles W. (2002) .*Introducing English Semantic*. Newyork : Routledge
- [8] McKeating, D. (1981). *The Teaching of English as an International Language: A Practical Guide*. Collins: Glasglow and London.
- [9] Richard, Jack C. (1973). *Error Analysis – Perspective on Second Language Acquisition*. Longman
- [10] Taiwo, Rotimi. (2001). Lexico-Semantic Relations Errors in Senior Secondary School Students' Writing. *Nordic Journal of African Studies, 10(3),366-373*
- [11] Thornbury, S. (1999). *How to Teach Grammar*. London: Pearson Education Limited.