J-PAI: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam
P-ISSN 2355-8237 | e-ISSN 2503-300X
Vol. 13 No. 1 July – December 2026
DOI: 10.18860/jpai.v13i1.42819

Hybrid governance in School-Based Management: Synergy of Authority in Shohwatul Is'ad Boarding School

[1] Andi Muhammad Ilham, [2] Suwendi, [3] Jafir Ramadhan
[1,2, & 3] Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, Indonesia

OPEN ACCESS

Corresponding Author:
Suwendi
suwendi@uinjkt.ac.id

Keywords:
Islamic Boarding Schools; School Based Management; Hybrid Governance; Stakeholder Participation; Pesantren Transformation

Abstract. *This study examines how the integration of pesantren leadership, foundations, and parents' guardians functions as a hybrid governance mechanism within the framework of School-Based Management (SBM) at Shohwatul Is'ad Islamic Boarding School. Existing studies on pesantren transformation have largely focused on modernization processes or educational management reforms, while limited attention has been given to how traditional charismatic authority is reconciled with contemporary demands for participation, transparency, and accountability. Using a qualitative case study approach, this research draws on interview data with parents' guardians and foundation representatives, supported by institutional documents and video documentation. The data were analyzed thematically using the interactive model of Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña, which involves data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing and verification. The findings reveal that governance integration is achieved through a three-pillar forum that serves as a participatory arena for communication, aspiration sharing, deliberation, and policy coordination. Within this arrangement, the kiai functions as a guardian of normative values and mediator, the foundation performs executive and administrative roles, while parents' guardians act as social controllers and institutional partners. The study further demonstrates that SBM principles are adapted through local traditions of musyawarah, consensus, and collective responsibility rather than being implemented through a purely Western managerial model. This adaptation produces a form of hybrid governance that preserves the charismatic legitimacy of pesantren while strengthening stakeholder participation, transparency, and institutional accountability. The study contributes to the literature on pesantren transformation by explaining the mechanisms through which traditional authority and modern governance practices are integrated within contemporary Islamic educational institutions.*

Abstrak. Penelitian ini mengkaji bagaimana integrasi antara pesantren, yayasan, dan wali santri berfungsi sebagai mekanisme *hybrid governance* dalam kerangka *School-Based Management* (SBM) di Pondok Pesantren Shohwatul Is'ad. Berbagai penelitian tentang transformasi pesantren selama ini lebih banyak menyoroti modernisasi kelembagaan atau reformasi manajemen pendidikan,

sementara kajian yang menjelaskan bagaimana otoritas karismatik kiai dipadukan dengan tuntutan partisipasi, transparansi, dan akuntabilitas masih relatif terbatas. Penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan kualitatif dengan desain studi kasus. Data diperoleh melalui wawancara dengan wali santri dan pihak yayasan, serta didukung oleh dokumentasi kelembagaan dan dokumentasi video. Data dianalisis secara tematis menggunakan model interaktif dari Miles, Huberman, dan Saldaña, yang mencakup reduksi data, penyajian data, serta penarikan dan verifikasi kesimpulan. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa integrasi tata kelola dibangun melalui forum tiga pilar yang menjadi ruang komunikasi, penyampaian aspirasi, musyawarah, dan koordinasi kebijakan antarpemangku kepentingan. Dalam mekanisme ini, kiai berperan sebagai penjaga nilai-nilai normatif sekaligus mediator, yayasan menjalankan fungsi eksekutif dan administratif, sedangkan wali santri bertindak sebagai pengontrol sosial sekaligus mitra institusional. Temuan penelitian menunjukkan bahwa prinsip-prinsip SBM tidak diterapkan secara murni mengikuti model Barat, melainkan diadaptasi melalui tradisi musyawarah, konsensus, dan tanggung jawab kolektif yang berkembang dalam kultur pesantren. Adaptasi tersebut menghasilkan bentuk *hybrid governance* yang mampu mempertahankan legitimasi karismatik pesantren sekaligus memperkuat partisipasi stakeholder, transparansi, dan akuntabilitas lembaga. Penelitian ini berkontribusi pada literatur transformasi pesantren dengan menjelaskan mekanisme integrasi antara otoritas tradisional dan praktik tata kelola modern dalam lembaga pendidikan Islam kontemporer.

A. INTRODUCTION

As an Islamic educational institution, a *pesantren* must meet five primary criteria to be legally recognized: the presence of a *kiai* (Islamic scholar/leader) or caretaker; resident students (*santri*); a mosque that serves as the hub for activities; the instruction of *kitab kuning* (traditional Islamic texts); and a dormitory or living quarters for the students. This fifth requirement serves as the foundation for the *pesantren*'s identity, distinguishing it from other types of educational institutions (Putra, 2019). However, underlying this foundation, the management system of a *pesantren* often faces significant challenges in addressing modern demands for transparency and accountability.

The figure of the *kiai* who holds full authority over policy direction and decision-making undoubtedly provides moral legitimacy and policy consistency. However, this arrangement often gives rise to issues concerning information transparency and public participation. Amidst modern demands for data openness, performance-based evaluation, and stakeholder engagement, the *kiai* serves as a pivotal figure who determines whether an islamic boarding school (*pesantren*) can adapt or whether it will remain tethered to traditional, long-standing patterns. The *kiai* is not merely a symbol of leadership; he also sits at the heart of a managerial dilemma: the tension between maintaining charismatic authority and creating space for the principles of good governance (Farihin, 2023). Consequently, the *kiai* represents both a challenge and the key to transforming the management system of a *pesantren* toward a more accountable model.

Within a theoretical framework, School-Based Management (SBM) is a model of school administration that grants greater autonomy in the form of authority and

responsibility to schools, enabling them to manage and maximize the potential of their communities to achieve established goals (Caldwell, 2005; Lestariningtyas, 2024). Since 1994, Indonesia's education system has moved toward an SBM model; this shift became more formalized from 1998 onward, coinciding with a broader push for decentralization across various (Kadir, 2024). This indicates that SBM is not merely a managerial concept, but rather an integral part of a larger wave of educational reform that emphasizes institutional autonomy and accountability.

Recent studies on the transformation of *pesantren* (Islamic boarding schools) suggest that their modernization cannot be understood as a linear progression from traditional to modern. Instead, it is an ongoing process of negotiation between the preservation of tradition and the demands of social change. *pesantren* are expected to maintain their distinct identities rooted in the study of classical Islamic texts (*kitab kuning*), a familial approach to student development, and the charismatic leadership of the *kiai* (Islamic scholar/leader), who serves as a source of moral and spiritual legitimacy. The evolving educational landscape has prompted *pesantren* to adopt various innovations, such as strengthening general academic curricula, integrating digital technology, professionalizing management, and implementing principles of institutional accountability (Lukens-Bull, 2001; Harmathilda, Yuli, Hakim, & Supriyadi, 2024; Muis et al., 2025). Consequently, the transformation of *pesantren* is essentially an effort to strike a balance between traditional legitimacy derived from religious authority and the demands for modern legitimacy, which rests on organizational effectiveness, transparency, and public accountability.

The challenge of achieving this balance has become increasingly relevant as *pesantren* (Islamic boarding schools) face growing demands for more participatory educational governance. Educational management literature suggests that the success of modern educational institutions is no longer determined solely by the strength of their internal leadership, but also by their capacity to involve stakeholders in decision-making processes. From the perspective of School-Based Management (SBM), institutional autonomy must go hand in hand with community participation and public accountability (Leithwood & Menzies, 1998; Barrera-Osorio et al., 2009). Consequently, the involvement of actors outside the institution's internal structure such as foundations, parents, and the broader community is considered essential for creating a governance framework that is responsive to the needs of the surrounding environment while upholding the quality of educational services.

This trend aligns with developments in the literature on "hybrid governance," which emphasizes that contemporary institutional governance no longer relies exclusively on formal bureaucratic structures or traditional authority. Instead, organizational legitimacy is built through a combination of formal rules, institutional leadership, and stakeholder engagement elements that collectively confer social legitimacy upon the policies adopted (Sakir, 2025). Within this framework, hybrid governance is understood as an effort to integrate two sources of legitimacy often perceived as contradictory: formal authority (which demands transparency and accountability) and socio-cultural authority (rooted in the trust, values, and traditions inherent to a community) (Rizkiyah, 2025). Thus, effective governance is not about replacing tradition with modern bureaucracy, but rather about reconciling the two within a mutually reinforcing relationship.

The literature on hybrid governance also emphasizes that modern governance is the result of sustained interaction between formal institutions and local interests that are socially and culturally inherited (Skelcher & Smith, 2015; Hsieh, 2023). In the context of pesantren (Islamic boarding schools), the blend of charismatic traditions and participatory governance makes the concept of hybrid governance particularly relevant. Modern Islamic

boarding schools can no longer be seen solely as educational institutions centered on the charisma of kiai (Islamic scholars/leaders); Islamic boarding schools must also function as educational organizations that meet the demands of effectiveness, transparency, and public accountability. As a result, the changes that occur in the *pesantren* environment represent more than just a shift in organizational or administrative structure; This is a continuous process of adjustment that preserves spiritual values while responding to the expectations of the community who are increasingly critical of the quality of governance in educational institutions.

This phenomenon is exemplified by the Shohwatul Is'ad Islamic Boarding School, which has fostered synergy among three main pillars: the leadership of the Islamic boarding school, the foundation (foundation), and the parents of students. Through the involvement of these three actors, the management of education no longer depends solely on the authority of the head of the Islamic boarding school. Instead, it incorporates participatory mechanisms that provide space for contributions from stakeholders outside the traditional leadership structure ("The 3-Pillar Meeting at PPMI Shohwatul Is'ad Building Educational Synergy," 2023). The presence of the foundation represents the formal and administrative aspects of the institution, while the parents of students serve as a manifestation of community participation. Meanwhile, the *pesantren* remains a center for upholding the religious values and moral authority that shape its institutional identity. The interaction between these three pillars reflects a hybrid governance model, which integrates the charismatic, bureaucratic, and participatory dimensions into a single education management system.

However, most of the existing research resources tend to examine the transformation of *pesantren* through the lens of educational modernization or explore participatory governance within the general framework of education management. Studies that specifically explain the application of School-Based Management (SBM) principles, especially in relation to the charismatic leadership of *kiai* (*pesantren* leaders), are still relatively limited. Similarly, studies on *hybrid governance* have so far been more developed in the realm of public administration and have not been widely applied to understand the dynamics of *pesantren* management, which has distinctive social, cultural, and spiritual dimensions. As a result, there is still a knowledge gap on how *pesantren* balance traditional authority with the demands of modern accountability through stakeholder participation mechanisms.

To fill this gap, this study aims to analyze how the convergence of the three pillars; namely the *pesantren* itself, the foundation, and the parents of the students function as a School-Based Management mechanism within the governance framework at the Shohwatul Is'ad Islamic Boarding School. This study seeks to explain how the principles of hybrid governance are manifested in the practice of *pesantren* management, especially in balancing the charismatic leadership of the *kiai* with the demands of transparency, participation, and public accountability. Thus, this study is expected to make a theoretical contribution to the development of research on SBM and *hybrid governance* in the context of Islamic education, as well as enrich the understanding of how *pesantren* governance is transformed in the modern era.

B. RESEARCH METHOD

This study uses a qualitative approach with a case study approach. The selection of this design is based on the need to deeply understand the dynamics of governance in the Shohwatul Is'ad Islamic Boarding School within the framework of *hybrid governance* theory. The qualitative approach allows researchers to examine phenomena contextually, while the literature review provides space to unravel the meanings, patterns, and

structures contained in relevant documents and digital media.

This study uses the results of interviews as primary data, video documentation (YouTube) and official publications from the Shohwatul Is'ad Islamic Boarding School as secondary data. The selection of this source aims to obtain a comprehensive picture of the governance practices of Islamic boarding schools, both from the formal institutional aspects and community participation. Thus, the data collected reflect the interaction between the bureaucratic structure of the foundation and the aspirations of the guardians of the students as part of the three pillars of the Islamic boarding school.

The data analysis technique is carried out through three main stages: data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing (Miles, Huberman, & Saldana, 2013). Data reduction is carried out by sorting out information relevant to the focus of the research; data presentation is carried out in the form of thematic categorization that makes it easier to read patterns; while drawing conclusions is carried out by referring to the theoretical framework of *hybrid governance*. Through these stages, this research is expected to be able to reveal how the integration between the formal structure of the foundation and the participation of student guardians contributes to the characteristics of modern Islamic boarding schools that are adaptive, inclusive, and accountable.

C. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

1. Profile of the Three Pillars

This study identifies the role of the three pillars in the governance of the Shohwatul Is'ad Islamic Boarding School. The three-pillar model at the Shohwatul Is'ad Islamic Modern Islamic Boarding School (PPMI) consists of *pesantren* management, foundations, and parents or guardians of students (Shohwatul Is'ad, 2023). This collaborative structure reflects a form of decentralized governance that is aligned with the key principles *of School-Based Management* (SBM) that encourages the empowerment of stakeholders at the school level to manage resources and make strategic decisions tailored to their local context (Hallinger & Heck, 2010; Briggs & Wohlstetter, 2003; Cheong Cheng, 1993).

First, the *pesantren*/*kiai* functions as a regulator, namely determining the direction of normative policies and maintaining charismatic traditions in the *pesantren* environment. The leadership of the *pesantren*/*kiai* is manifested in four main dimensions: spiritual leadership, moral guidance, institutional decision-making, and social relations among the community. *Kiai*/*pesantren* play the role of spiritual guides, moral examples, strategic leaders, and social mediators between the *pesantren* and the wider community (Masruroh, Tamyiz, Shodiq, & Muzahid, 2025). This multidimensional leadership is in line with the traditional concept of *pesantren*, namely *tarbiyah bil hal* (education through example), where the spiritual and moral authority of the *kiai* is the main foundation for character formation and spiritual guidance (Anisaturrizqi, Hanifiyah, & Crismono, 2025). Within the framework of MBS, this kind of charismatic leadership is essential to build a shared vision that focuses on character development as well as academic excellence (Briggs & Wohlstetter, 2003; Fullan & Watson, 2000).

Second, parents or guardians of students play the role of supporters as well as parties who carry out the function of social control; The latest systematic studies show that parental involvement is a multidimensional construct that contributes to academic development, school-family communication, and strengthening relationships between educational institutions and stakeholders (Helena Mocho et al, 2025). They not only support the sustainability of pesantren through financial and moral contributions, but also demand transparency and quality of educational services. Pesantren cannot be separated from the support of the community, especially guardians of students, who play a role as moral and material supporters. This reciprocal relationship makes pesantren not just an

educational institution, but part of a social system that must be responsible for the quality of services to the community (Dhofier, 2011; Epstein & Sheldon, 2023). In the context of School-Based Management (SBM), substantial parental involvement is a crucial determinant for the success of educational achievement and institutional accountability, which transforms the relationship between school and society into a two-way partnership that trusts each other (Ramdzan et al., 2021). Through SBM, the distribution of authority and the exchange of information with parents ensure that they are not just symbolic figures, but active partners in decision-making—this directly increases student motivation and discipline, as well as the overall performance of the institution (Briggs & Wohlstetter, 2003; Lestari, Mahendra, Fitria, & Jemain, 2023).

Third, the foundation plays an executive role. Based on the Decree of the Minister of Religion Number 941 of 2024 concerning Islamic Boarding School Education Quality Standards, the *pesantren* model also emphasizes c importance of accountable, transparent, and participatory governance, so that *pesantren* are able to respond to the needs of the community while maintaining Islamic scientific traditions (Ministry of Religion of the Republic of Indonesia, 2024). Therefore, the implementation of policies and the management of administrative, financial, and operational aspects are the benchmarks for the foundation's performance in the modern *pesantren* model. The synergy of these three pillars forms a unique governance structure, which is different from the formal education model in general.

2. Integration Mechanism

After describing the characteristics and roles of each actor in the three-pillar governance model, this section discusses the mechanisms that allow foundations, Islamic boarding schools, and guardians of students to be connected in one integrated governance system. The analysis focuses on communication patterns, the channeling of aspirations, inter-stakeholder coordination, as well as the decision-making process that develops through the three-pillar forum. The findings show that integration is not only built through formal organizational structures, but also through various participatory mechanisms that allow for information exchange, problem solving, and alignment of interests among stakeholders.

a. Participation of Wali Santri

The results of the interview show that the three-pillar forum is understood by the guardians of the students as a space of participation that brings together foundations, *pesantren*, and parents in one communication forum. The involvement of the guardians of the students is not symbolic, but rather a means to convey aspirations, complaints, and various proposals related to educational services and the life of students in the *pesantren*. As explained by one of the guardians of the students:

> "As much as possible, I will definitely participate, because it is an event to convey aspirations, ideas, or ideas. The meeting is the best opportunity because all parties are present, starting from the foundation, the school, to parents." (Mrs. Nadra, Wali Santri).

The findings show that stakeholder participation is not only procedural, but also creates a space for dialogue that allows for more inclusive decision-making (Genesis Tayanes et al, 2025). The participatory mechanism is further institutionalized through a three-pillar forum that formally brings together foundations, Islamic boarding schools, and guardians of students in a common agenda. The following is the arrangement of the Three Pillars meeting at SMA IT Shohwatul Is'ad:

Table 2.1 Rundown of the three-pillar meeting.

Time	Activity	Main Actors	Governance Function

09.00–09.30	Reception	Foundation Committee	Administrative Coordination
09.30–09.45	Cultural Performance	Students	Cultural Representation
09.45–10.15	Opening & Mudir Speech	*Kiai*/*Mudir*	Normative Leadership
10.15–10.30	School Committee Speech	Guardians	Community Representation
10.30–10.45	Foundation Speech	Foundation	Executive Governance
10.45–11.45	Q&A Session	Three Pillars	Participatory Deliberation
11.45–12.00	Closing	Foundation & Guardians	Institutional Harmonization

Source : (Shohwatul Is'ad, 2023)

Based on the statement from the guardian of the students and the composition of the activities described above, both are proof that the three-pillar meeting forum is a forum to negotiate the relationship between the foundation's policies and the aspirations of parents and guardians of students. This interaction illustrates the practical application of hybrid governance in the *pesantren* environment.

b. Integration of Aspirations in Decision Making

Based on the results of the interviews, the three-pillar forum not only functions as a space for conveying aspirations, but also as a mechanism for integrating interests between guardians of students, Islamic boarding schools, and foundations. The guardians of students explained that various complaints that were previously difficult to get a response can be discussed again in the forum and become a consideration in the formulation of institutional policies.

> "After the message is conveyed to the three pillars, the foundation prepares rules. These rules are then used as SOPs, such as SOPs for laundry units." (Mrs. Nadra, Wali Santri)

Furthermore, the guardian explained that the three-pillar meeting allows various issues to be discussed openly by presenting all elements related to the problem so that decisions can be taken collectively. This mechanism shows that the three-pillar forum functions as a deliberative arena. This finding is in line with the collaborative governance approach that emphasizes the importance of face-to-face dialogue, trust building, and joint negotiation in the formulation of organizational policies (Ansell & Gash, 2008; Emerson et al., 2012; Elken, 2024), which connects the aspirations of the community with the decision-making process at the foundation and *pesantren* management levels. The findings were strengthened by an explanation from Prof. Yusing Sanusi Baso as the chairman of the foundation who explained that every input from parents is discussed again through the internal mechanisms of the foundation and *pesantren* managers.

> "Every time there is input like this, I accept it. This input is what I then bring to discuss in our internal group with the director and other administrators." (Prof. Yusring Sanusi Baso, Foundation Trustee)

This data shows that parents' aspirations do not stop at the communication stage, but are translated into the process of evaluation and institutional policy formation. Thus, the integration of the three pillars takes place through a consultation and deliberation mechanism that connects the interests of stakeholders with the pesantren management authority.

c. Transparency and Accountability

The results of the interviews show that transparency is one of the main principles that sustain the relationship between foundations, *pesantren*, and guardians of students. These findings are in line with SBM implementation research which shows that stakeholder participation is closely related to strengthening governance and accountability mechanisms at the school level (Miranda & Lugo, 2026). The foundation chairman explained that program developments, institutional achievements, and various *pesantren* activities are regularly reported to parents as a form of organizational accountability.

> "We report all these activities and developments to the guardian's parents. We share the form of reporting regularly through the guardian communication group, and uploaded to the foundation's Instagram social media as a form of public transparency as well as the content of documentation of activities." (Prof. Yusring Sanusi Baso, Foundation Trustee).

The practice of transparency is not only carried out through face-to-face forums, but also through various communication media that allow guardians of students to obtain information about the development of *pesantren* activities. In the same interview, the chairman of the foundation emphasized that the three-pillar meeting is held periodically as a means of reporting the institution's achievements to parents.

> "Through the regular meeting of the three pillars of the inlah, the management submits a report on the achievement of the program as a form of accountability and accountability of the institution." (Prof. Yusring Sanusi Baso, Foundation Trustee)

The foundation retains authority over administrative and curricular matters, while parents and guardians of students participate by expressing expectations regarding transparency, service quality, and balance between tahfidz programs and academic programs. In this configuration, the *kiai* or mudir plays the role of mediator who facilitates deliberations, while ensuring that institutional decision-making remains based on the tradition of charismatic leadership in the *pesantren*.

The above findings show that the three-pillar forum not only functions as a means of communication between foundations, Islamic boarding schools, and guardians of students, but also as a mechanism that connects the process of conveying aspirations, decision-making, information transparency, and institutional accountability. To clarify the relationship between actors and the governance functions carried out in the forum, the synthesis of the results of the analysis is presented in Table A.2.

Table 2.2 Analysis of the Content of the Three Pillars Meeting

No	Activity Items	Actors/Pillars Involved	Meaning in Islamic Boarding School Governance
1	Mudir Speech	*Kiai* / *Mudir* (Regulator)	Affirming the normative authority and charismatic tradition of *pesantren* as the guardian of policy direction.
2	School Committee Speech	Students' Parents and Guardians (Social Control)	Representation of community aspirations; demanding transparency, quality of service, and balance of the curriculum.
3	Foundation Celebration	Foundation (Executive)	Shows the role of the foundation as an administrative, financial, and operational manager of the Islamic boarding school.
4	Q&A Session	All Pillars (Negotiation Forum)	The space for integrating foundation policies with the needs of guardians of students is mediated by *kiai* through a culture of deliberation.

5	Closing (Prayer & Closing)	Guardian/Foundation	A symbol of harmonization between spiritual traditions and modern governance.

Source : (Shohwatul Is'ad, 2023)

Based on the results of interviews and analyzed documentation, the integration mechanism in the three-pillar governance at the Shohwatul Is'ad Islamic Boarding School was built through a combination of participatory forums, cross-actor communication, and deliberation processes involving foundations, *pesantren*, and guardians of students. Guardians of students not only play the role of policy recipients, but also as sources of aspirations that also influence institutional discussions and evaluations. On the other hand, the foundation carries out coordination and administrative decision-making functions while still opening up dialogue spaces for stakeholders. Meanwhile, *pesantren* through their mudir and leadership structure play a role in maintaining the continuity of normative values that are the foundation of the institution. Therefore, the integration of the three pillars not only results in organizational coordination, but also creates a governance mechanism that is able to connect traditional authorities with the demands of modern participation, transparency, and accountability.

3. Model Hybrid Synthesis

The Shohwatul Is'ad *pesantren* governance model shows that the implementation of School Based Management (SBM) is not carried out purely following Western patterns, but has undergone a typical adaptation process in accordance with the local culture of Indonesia. Rather than forcing a standardized Western organizational template, this hybrid structure operates under the principle of equifinality, which posits that educational institutions can achieve high effectiveness by adapting their governance models to their unique cultural, social, and spiritual realities (Cheong Cheng, 1993). This adaptation is evident through the culture of deliberation, which is the main mechanism in maintaining the internal political stability of the Islamic boarding school. This collaborative decision-making process transforms SBM from a mere administrative structure into a deep cultural practice, fostering a shared learning and community imperative that ensures local ownership and long-term sustainability (Fullan & Watson, 2000). This finding is consistent with Pratikno's view that the transformation of *pesantren* should not rely solely on institutional age or leadership charisma but must be supported by mature, collaborative, and well-directed governance (as cited in Yahya, 2025). Similarly, the broader institutional discourse on *pesantren* transformation emphasizes the need for *pesantren* to respond to contemporary challenges while maintaining their Islamic identity (Fathiyah, 2025).

The remarks by the Director of Pondok Pesantren Modern Islam (PPMI) Shohwatul Is'ad reinforced research findings regarding the Three-Pillar Model and forms of hybrid governance. In his speech, the Director explained that the day's agenda consisted of two main events: the monthly religious study session (*pengajian bulanan*) for the entire academic community and the regular "Three Pillars" meeting, which brings together boarding school administrators, the foundation, and representatives of the students' parents. This gathering was utilized as a policy coordination mechanism to improve the quality of the boarding school in the future. Furthermore, the Director also informally expressed the hope that the religious study forum, attended by the Chair of BAZNAS (National Amil Zakat Agency) Makassar, could mobilize the potential of zakat, infaq, and sadaqah, as well as waqf management, to support the institution's operational sustainability. In terms of legitimacy, the opening with a prayer and paying respects to prominent figures underscores the position of the kiai/director as a normative authority; in terms of participation, the involvement of teachers, mentors, parents, and students

reinforces the social control function of the students' guardians. This multi-stakeholder participation is highly aligned with McGregor's Theory Y, where active engagement and shared responsibility motivate stakeholders to commit deeply to the school's developmental goals (Berhanu, 2023). The combination of administrative routines (monthly religious study sessions, semesterly meetings) and local values (consultation, hospitality) revealed in this opening address is consistent with the concept of Hybrid Governance—namely, the integration of modern management practices with local norms—so that governance becomes participatory, adaptive, and sustainable (Shohwatul Is'ad, 2023, 56:16-58:00).

Thus, Shohwatul Is'ad presents a unique form of hybrid governance: the foundation performs executive functions by managing administrative, financial, and operational aspects; the guardian of the students acts as a social control as well as a moral and material supporter; while the *kiai* acts as a regulator of tradition and mediator in the negotiation process. This synergy results in governance that is not just top-down, but participatory, adaptive, and rooted in local values. This is what distinguishes *pesantren* from formal education models, while also making them relevant to modern demands for transparency and accountability.

Furthermore, the application of SBM in Shohwatul Is'ad can be referred to as Indonesianized SBM, because the principles of autonomy and accountability derived from Western theories have been combined with the values of deliberation, mutual cooperation, and consensus. The culture of deliberation serves not only as a mechanism for internal democratization but also as a means of mitigating potential conflicts between foundation policies and the aspirations of students' parents and guardians. Through this process, internal institutional stability within the *pesantren* can be maintained, enabling the institution to sustain its educational, social, and spiritual functions. This finding is consistent with Anshory et al. (2024) who found that School-Based Management (SBM) in Islamic education is effective in enhancing accountability and community participation. Similarly, Moh Slamet Untung (2011) emphasizing the need to reconstruct *pesantren* management to be adaptive to socio-cultural changes.

D. CONCLUSION

This study concludes that the three-pillar model at the Shohwatul Is'ad Islamic Boarding School represents a hybrid form of governance that integrates the traditional authority of the *pesantren* with the principles of modern governance within the framework of School-Based Management (SBM). In this configuration, the *pesantren* or *kiai* plays the role of the guardian of normative direction and institutional values, the foundation performs administrative and managerial functions, while the guardian of the students functions as a participatory partner who conveys aspirations and carries out the function of social control. The three actors do not work separately, but are connected through a three-pillar forum that functions as a space for communication, deliberation, coordination, and institutional accountability.

The findings of the study show that the three-pillar forum is not only a ceremonial agenda, but also serves as a mechanism for integrating interests between foundations, pesantren, and guardians of students (Hybrid Governance). Through the forum, various aspirations and complaints of guardians of students can be conveyed, discussed, and considered in the process of evaluation and institutional decision-making. At the same time, foundations and pesantren carry out the function of transparency and accountability through program reporting, delivery of institutional information, and follow-up on various inputs received from stakeholders. This mechanism shows that community participation

can go hand in hand with the charismatic leadership of kiai without compromising the traditional legitimacy that is the distinctive character of pesantren.

Theoretically, this study shows that the implementation of School-Based Management in the context of *pesantren* does not take place through the adoption of purely Western models, but through an adaptation process that combines the principles of participation, transparency, and accountability with local values such as deliberation, mutual cooperation, and consensus. Therefore, the governance that develops in Shohwatul Is'ad can be understood as a form of Indonesianized School-Based Management, which is a governance model that maintains the identity, tradition, and moral authority of the *pesantren* while being able to respond to the demands of modern educational governance.

The implications of this study show that the three-pillar model has the potential to be developed as an alternative to participatory governance in other Islamic boarding schools that face the demands of increasing transparency and accountability. However, this research is still limited to one case study of modern Islamic boarding schools. Therefore, the next study can be compared with traditional Islamic boarding schools and other foundation-based Islamic boarding schools to gain a more comprehensive understanding of the variations in the implementation of hybrid governance in the context of Islamic education in the Indonesia.

REFERENCES

Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative governance in theory and practice. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, *18*(4), 543–571. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032

Anshory, S., Citriadin, Y., & Maujud, F. (2024). Tata Kelola Pendidikan Islam: Strategi Manajemen dan Tantangan Kontemporer. *ASCENT: Al-Bahjah Journal of Islamic Education Management*, *2*(1), 36–41. https://doi.org/10.61553/ascent.v2i1.128

Barrera Osorio, F. (2009). *Decentralized decision-making in schools: The theory and evidence on school-based management*. The World Bank.

Berhanu, K. Z. (2023). Practices, Challenges, and prospects of Implementing School-Based Management (SBM) System in Ethiopian Schools: Implications for Policy Makers. *Research in Educational Administration and Leadership*, *8*(2), 465–504. https://doi.org/10.30828/real.1275282

Briggs, K. L., & Wohlstetter, P. (2003). Key Elements of a Successful School-Based Management Strategy. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, *14*(3), 351–372. https://doi.org/10.1076/sesi.14.3.351.15840

Caldwell, B. J. (2005). *School-Based Management.* . Paris-Brussels: UNESCO-IIEP and International Academy of Education.

Cheong Cheng, Y. (1993). The Theory and Characteristics of School-based Management. *International Journal of Educational Management*, *7*(6). https://doi.org/10.1108/09513549310046659

Dhofier, Z. (2011). *Tradisi pesantren: Studi pandangan hidup kyai dan visinya mengenai masa depan Indonesia* (Cet. 8 rev.). LP3ES. Retrieved from https://cir.nii.ac.jp/crid/1971149384762836125

Elken, M. (2024). Collaborative design of governance instruments in higher education. *Studies in Higher Education*, *49*(6), 1095–1106. https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2023.2258905

Emerson, K., Nabatchi, T., & Balogh, S. (2012). An integrative framework for collaborative governance. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, *22*(1), 1–29. https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mur011

Epstein, J. L. (2018). *School, family, and community partnerships : Preparing educators and improving schools*. Boulder, Co: Westview Press, a Member of the Perseus Books Group.

Farihin, H., & Khasani, F. (2023). Etika Profetik Santri; resepsi hadis pada tradisi pendidikan pesantren. *J-PAI: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, *9*(2). https://doi.org/10.18860/jpai.v9i2.24128

Fathiyah, F. (2025, November 27). UIN Alauddin Tuan Rumah Halaqah Penguatan Pendirian Dirjen *Pesantren*. Retrieved April 26, 2026, from UIN Alauddin Makassar website: https://uin-alauddin.ac.id/berita/detail/uin-alauddin-tuan-rumah-halaqah-penguatan-pendirian-dirjen-*pesantren*/17245

Fullan, M., & Watson, N. (2000). School-Based Management: Reconceptualizing to Improve Learning Outcomes. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, *11*(4), 453–473. https://doi.org/10.1076/sesi.11.4.453.3561

Genesis Z. Tayanes, M., Kissy Kyle S. Lozarito, M., & Escarlos, G. S. (2025). Reframing School Stakeholder Engagement through the Lens of Critical Theory: A Systematic Review of Governance and Leadership Perspective. *International Journal of Research and Innovation in Social Science*, 9(10), 5280–5299. https://doi.org/10.47772/IJRISS.2025.910000433

Hallinger, P., & Heck, R. H. (2010). Collaborative leadership and school improvement: Understanding the impact on school capacity and student learning. *School Leadership & Management*, *30*(2), 95–110. https://doi.org/10.1080/13632431003663214

Harmathilda, H., Yuli, Y., Hakim, A. R., & Supriyadi, C. (2024). Transformasi Pendidikan *Pesantren* Di Era Modern: Antara Tradisi Dan Inovasi. *Karimiyah*, *4*(1), 33–50. https://doi.org/10.59623/karimiyah.v4i1.51

Hsieh, C.-C. (2023). Governance in transition: An analytical framework for hybridity and dynamics in higher education. *Higher Education*, *85*(2), 379–397. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10734-022-00839-3

Kadir, A. (2024). Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah (Solusi Alternatif Dunia Pendidikan). *Alasma | Jurnal Media Informasi Dan Komunikasi Ilmiah*, *6*(1), 34–43.

Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia. (2024). *Keputusan Menteri Agama Republik Indonesia Nomor 941 Tahun 2024 tentang Standar Mutu Pendidikan Pesantren pada Ma'had Aly* [Keputusan Menteri Agama Republik Indonesia Nomor 941 Tahun 2024]. Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia. Retrieved from Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia website: https://www.scribd.com/document/790737610/KMA-No-941-Standar-Mutu-pada-Mahad-Aly-stempel

Leithwood, K., & Menzies, T. (1998). Forms and effects of school-based management: A review. *Educational Policy*, *12*(3), 325–346. https://doi.org/10.1177/0895904898012003006

Lestari, W., Mahendra, F. E., Fitria, N., & Jemain, Z. (2023). *Optimizing School-Based Management to Improve Student Performance: A Review of the 2023 Curriculum*.

Lestariningtyas, L. (2024). Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Melalui Pemberdayaan Masyarakat dan Peran Komite Serta Tantangan Pelaksanaannya. *Jurnal Inovasi Pembelajaran di Sekolah*, *5*(1), 077–086. https://doi.org/10.51874/jips.v5i1.225

Lukens-Bull, R. A. (2001). Two sides of the same coin: Modernity and tradition in islamic education in Indonesia. *Anthropology Education Quarterly*, *32*(3), 350–372. https://doi.org/10.1525/aeq.2001.32.3.350

Masruroh, M., Tamyiz, A., Shodiq, A., & Muzahid, H. (2025). Peran Kepemimpinan Kiyai dalam Pengelolaan dan Pembentukan Karakter Santri di *Pesantren*. *TSAQOFAH*, *6*(1), 74–83. https://doi.org/10.58578/tsaqofah.v6i1.8012

Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2013). *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook*. SAGE Publications.

Miranda, M. C., & Lugo, M. G. R. (2026). Assessing School- Based Management Implementation and Stakeholder Participation in Governance and Accountability Among Public Schools. *IJFMR - International Journal For Multidisciplinary Research*, *8*(3). https://doi.org/10.36948/ijfmr.2026.v08i03.80127

Mocho, H., Martins, C., dos Santos, R., Ratinho, E., & Nunes, C. (2025). Measuring Parental School Involvement: A Systematic Review. *European Journal of Investigation in Health, Psychology and Education*, *15*(6), 96. https://doi.org/10.3390/ejihpe15060096

Muis, R. R., Lili, I., Arifudin, I., Gloria, R. Y., & Wiradinata, D. R. (2025). The transformation of islamic boarding schools in Indonesia: A shift in organizational management and leadership patterns. *JPUS: Jurnal Pendidikan Untuk Semua*, *9*(1), 67–74. https://doi.org/10.26740/jpus.v9n1.p67-74

Putra, B. A. (2019, October 23). UU Nomor 18 Tahun 2019 tentang *Pesantren*, Untuk Siapa? Retrieved April 25, 2026, from https://diy.kemenag.go.id/news/2772-uu-nomor-18-tahun-2019-tentang-*pesantren*-untuk-siapa.html

Ramdzan, S. N., Suhaimi, J., Harris, K. M., Khoo, E. M., Liew, S. M., Cunningham, S., & Pinnock, H. (2021). School-based self-management interventions for asthma among primary school children: A systematic review. *Npj Primary Care Respiratory Medicine*, *31*(1), 18. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41533-021-00230-2

Rizkiyah, N. (2025). *Tata Kelola Pendidikan Adaptif: Sinergi Analitik Data dan Manajemen Risiko untuk Keunggulan Mutu dan Akuntabilitas Berkelanjutan*.

Sakir, A. R. (2025). *Hybrid Governance dalam Kebijakan Publik: Studi Tinjauan Literatur Sistematis tentang Kolaborasi, Tantangan, dan Faktor Keberhasilan*. *2*(3).

Shohwatul Is'ad. (2023). *Pertemuan 3 Pilar dan Pengajian Bulanan November 2023 | Ust. Ashar Tamanggong, S.Ag., M.Ag.* Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=17Bci1awjqg

Skelcher, C., & Smith, S. R. (2014). Theorizing hybridity: Institutional logics, complex organizations, and actor identities: The case of nonprofits. *Public Administration*, *93*(2), 433–448. https://doi.org/10.1111/padm.12105

Untung, M. S. (2011). Rekonstruksi Manajemen Pendidikan *Pesantren*. *Edukasia Islamika*, *9*(2), 69501.

Yahya, Y. I. (2025, July 12). Prof. Pratikno: Transformasi *Pesantren* Dimulai dari Tata Kelola yang Matang. Retrieved August 14, 2026, from Tebuireng Online website: https://tebuireng.online/prof-pratikno-transformasi-*pesantren*-dimulai-dari-tata-kelola-yang-matang/